North Atlantic cooling triggered a zonal mode over the Indian Ocean during Heinrich Stadial 1

Xiaojing Du1,2,*, James M. Russell1,2, Zhengyu Liu3, Bette L. Otto-Bliesner4, Delia W. Oppo5, Mahyar Mohtadi6, Chenyu Zhu7, Valier V. Galy8, Enno Schefuss9, Yan Yan9, Yair Rosenthal10, Nathalie Dubois11,12, Jennifer Arbuszewski5, Yu Gao13

Abrupt changes in the Atlantic meridional overturning circulation (AMOC) are thought to affect tropical hydroclimate through adjustment of the latitudinal position of the intertropical convergence zone (ITCZ). Heinrich Stadial 1 (HS1) involves the largest AMOC reduction in recent geological time; however, over the tropical Indian Ocean (IO), proxy records suggest zonal anomalies featuring intense, widespread drought in tropical East Africa versus generally wet but heterogeneous conditions in the Maritime Continent. Here, we synthesize proxy data and an isotope-enabled transient deglacial simulation and show that the southward ITCZ shift over the eastern IO during HS1 strengthens IO Walker circulation, triggering an east-west precipitation dipole across the basin. This dipole reverses the zonal precipitation anomalies caused by the exposed Sunda and Sahul shelves due to glacial lower sea level. Our study illustrates how zonal modes of atmosphere-ocean circulation can amplify or reverse global climate anomalies, highlighting their importance for future climate change.

INTRODUCTION

The tropical ocean-atmosphere circulation exerts a profound influence on the global climate system (1). The Walker circulation is a critical component of the tropical climate system and is closely tied to zonal coupled ocean-atmospheric modes, such as the Indian Ocean dipole (IOD), but its response to global warming is still debated (2, 3). Some studies predict a weakening Walker circulation due to different rates of increasing precipitation and moisture under greenhouse warming (3), leading to more frequent extreme IOD events (4), whereas other studies suggest no detectable changes in IOD (5). Whereas these studies emphasize the impacts of radiative forcing in the tropics on the Walker circulation, the weakening Atlantic meridional overturning circulation (AMOC) due to increased greenhouse gases (GHG) (6) and freshwater discharge from Greenland ice sheet and Arctic sea ice melting (7, 8) is also predicted to exert a remote influence on the Walker circulation (9, 10). Therefore, understanding the influence of North Atlantic climate perturbations on the Walker circulation is particularly important for climate prediction.

Millennial-scale North Atlantic cooling events during the last deglaciation caused by meltwater/iceberg discharge [e.g., Heinrich Stadial 1 (HS1), ~18 to 14.5 thousand years (ka) ago; and Younger Dryas (YD), ~12.9 to 11.7 ka ago] have long been used to investigate global responses to AMOC perturbations and provide a unique opportunity to investigate the tropical response to North Atlantic forcing under different boundary conditions (11–19). Previous modeling and proxy studies of HS1 and YD have focused on interhemispherically antiphased precipitation changes in the tropics attributed to meridional shifts of the intertropical convergence zone (ITCZ) (11, 13, 14). Although meridional precipitation anomalies are recorded from the Atlantic (15, 16) and South America (18, 20, 21) during HS1, proxy records show complex spatial patterns in other regions. These include interhemispheric drought extending from northern Africa to southern tropical Africa (~20°S) (Fig. 1) and heterogeneous precipitation patterns over the Maritime Continent (17, 19, 22). These records suggest that ITCZ displacement alone does not fully explain precipitation anomalies in the tropics during Heinrich events, but to date, there is no alternative theory to explain variations in the tropical Indian Ocean (IO) region. Here, we explore the mechanisms of hydroclimate changes over the tropical IO during HS1 by integrating a new isotope-enabled transient climate model experiment (iTRACE) (23) and multiproxy hydroclimate records across the IO.

RESULTS

Proxy model synthesis

We used iTRACE (23) to investigate the mechanisms driving hydroclimate changes over the IO during HS1 inferred from proxy data and their imprint on water isotopes (Materials and Methods). iTRACE was performed from the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM) to the early Holocene (20 to 11 ka ago) using the water isotope-enabled Community Earth System Model 1.3 (CESM1.3). CESM is capable of simulating major features of water isotopes and climate variations during the last deglaciation, including the IO region (23–
Comparison with modern observations also suggests that iCESM can realistically capture the observed spatial pattern of precipitation and δ18Oprecip anomalies associated with the IO zonal mode (fig. S1). In iTRACE, four simulations with four realistic forcing scenarios were applied additively, including ice sheet and ocean bathymetry (ICE), insolation (ICE + ORB), GHG (ICE + ORB + GHG), and full-forcing including meltwater fluxes (MWFs) (ICE + ORB + GHG + MWF). The effects of MWFs were isolated by subtracting ICE + ORB + GHG from the full-forcing experiment to investigate the tropical response to North Atlantic forcing.

We compiled multiproxy hydroclimate records spanning the deglaciation from the IO and compared these records to the outputs from iTRACE. We synthesized precipitation-sensitive proxies from the Maritime Continent and East Africa, as well as proxy data reflecting sea surface temperature (SST) and thermocline depth in the tropical IO. Our synthesis resulted in a network of 24 precipitation (table S1), 33 SST (table S2), and 5 thermocline depth proxy records (table S3). The precipitation data include speleothem δ18O, leaf wax δD, lake level, pollen, and detrital sediment flux. We classified precipitation anomalies as either drier or wetter as these proxies do not provide a quantitative estimate of precipitation change. To facilitate comparison to meltwater-forcing simulations in iTRACE, we normalized and detrended SST data (Mg/Ca of planktic foraminifera or U137 index) to remove the deglacial warming trend. The relative depth of the thermocline was inferred from the difference between surface and thermocline temperatures (larger difference indicates shallower thermocline and vice versa).

Both HS1 (14.5 to 18 ka ago) and YD (11.7 to 12.9 ka ago) hydroclimate anomalies were calculated relative to the Bolling-Allerød (BA, 12.9 to 14.5 ka ago), which serves as a baseline for the comparison to assess responses to AMOC and expand the proxy network (some records do not extend to LGM).

The MWF simulation predicts a large east-west precipitation dipole anomaly over the tropical IO during HS1. This dipole is unique to the IO and to HS1 and emerges in the context of north-south dipole anomalies in precipitation simulated elsewhere in the tropics during HS1 and over the tropical IO during the YD (Fig. 1 and fig. S6). Widespread drying was simulated in the western IO, from the Arabian Sea and northern Africa to ~15°S south of the equator, whereas wetter conditions dominate from the central equatorial to the eastern and southern Maritime Continent (Fig. 2). Precipitation reconstructions indicate widespread drying in tropical East Africa (from northern Africa to ~20°S) during HS1 and a more heterogeneous pattern in the Maritime Continent, including wetter conditions in Java and Flores, little change or dry over Sumatra, weak drying to no change on Sulawesi (26, 27), and dry conditions in northern Borneo, similar to the simulations (Fig. 2). Simulated SST anomalies in response to MWF also display a zonal dipole over the tropical IO with warming in the eastern IO and moderate cooling over the west (Fig. 2). The precipitation dipole in the proxy reconstructions, with drying in the west and generally wetter (but more heterogeneous) conditions in the east, shows statistically significant agreement with the simulations, with a Cohen’s κ = 0.71 (P < 0.01). The SST change in proxy reconstructions and simulations are also correlated [correlation coefficient (r) = 0.56, P < 0.01], and both proxy records and simulations show that the thermocline deepened over the eastern IO and shoaled over the western IO during HS1.

**IO zonal dipole in response to HS1**

The zonal dipole in precipitation, SST, and thermocline depth suggests a strengthened IO Walker circulation during HS1. This is consistent with decreased ascending motion and convection in the western IO and increased ascending motion and convection over the eastern IO indicated by vertical velocity anomalies (Fig. 3C). This dipole arises because of interactions between the North Atlantic heat transport, the ITCZ, and the IO Walker circulation. The southward shift of the ITCZ in response to abrupt AMOC reductions and North Atlantic cooling during HS1 reduces precipitation...
in the Northern Hemisphere (NH) tropics and promotes precipitation in the Southern Hemisphere (SH) tropics, as observed in the Pacific and Atlantic Ocean basins (Fig. 1A). Over the IO, the strengthened Hadley cell and trade winds in NH (28–30°) during HS1 produce northeasterly wind anomalies and cooling over the Arabian Sea (Fig. 3B). The weakened SH Hadley cell leads to weakened southeasterly trade winds in the equatorial eastern IO (indicated by northwesterly anomalies in Fig. 3B), which suppress the upwelling of cooler water off Sumatra and Java, deepen the thermocline (Fig. S2), and warm SST over this region. Such SST anomalies strengthen the IO Walker circulation via the Bjerknes feedback (31), leading to wetter/warmer conditions and a deeper thermocline in the eastern IO and the opposite response in the western IO.

The weakened southeasterly trade winds in the equatorial eastern IO arising from ITCZ migration thus promote mean conditions during HS1 that resemble the negative phase of the modern-
day IOD. The zonal dipole anomalies in winds and temperature strengthen in boreal summer and peak in boreal fall (figs. S3 and S4), similar to modern IOD events. Determining the relationships between seasonal-to-interannual variability and the millennial-scale mean state during HS1 would require further analysis; however, we note that interannual surface temperature variability west of the Maritime Continent increased during HS1, relative to the YD in iTTRACE (fig. S5) and similar to previous studies (32, 33). The probability density functions of the simulated IOD index in iTTRACE also suggest a higher probability of negative IOD events during HS1 (fig. S6). This shift could contribute to the long-term zonal dipole and strengthened Walker circulation during HS1 in the IO.

The zonal dipole is unique to HS1 and the IO, standing in contrast to the meridional dipole structure that develops in the tropical IO during the YD (Fig. 1B and fig. S7) and in other tropical oceans during HS1 (Fig. 1A). The amplitude of AMOC decline in iTTRACE is comparable during HS1 and YD, but the zonal responses are distinct to HS1, implying that AMOC alone cannot explain the IO zonal dipole (fig. S10). Similarly, the proxy network indicates distinct YD and HS1 responses that align with meridional shifts during the YD and zonal changes during HS1 (Fig. 3 and fig. S7). We suggest that the zonal IO response arises from the impact of lower sea level and exposed continental shelves in the Maritime Continent during HS1. Previous model and proxy studies indicate that during the LGM, the exposure of the Sunda and Sahul shelves induces a positive Bjerknes feedback and a weak Walker circulation across the IO, causing drying over the eastern IO and wetter conditions in coastal East Africa (34–36)—the opposite conditions from those that we observe during HS1. The strengthening of the IO Walker circulation in response to HS1 thus opposes the preexisting weaker Walker circulation during the LGM (fig. S8), amplifying the magnitude of the zonal dipole anomalies over the IO (we note that HS1 anomalies calculated relative to LGM are very similar to anomalies relative to BA in iTTRACE; fig. S9). The Sunda and Sahul shelves remained largely exposed during HS1 [both in our simulations (24) and according to sea level reconstructions applied to the current bathymetry] but were partially inundated during the YD (Fig. 1). In particular, between HS1 and YD, the rising sea levels inundated the northwest (NW) Australia shelf and parts of the Sunda shelf, both of which have been shown to be important to zonal circulation over the IO (24, 33), explaining the different responses to MWF during these intervals. This highlights the sensitivity and complexity of the IO climate and its response to different global boundary conditions.

Megadroughts and extreme precipitation across the IO

The IO zonal dipole triggered hydrological extremes across the basin, including widespread droughts in East Africa and increased precipitation over most of Indonesia. It has long been a challenge to explain the zonal asymmetric hydroclimate anomalies during HS1 over the tropical IO. Previous studies attributed droughts in East Africa during HS1 to an extreme shift of the ITCZ to southernmost Africa (37, 38), a weakening of Indian winter monsoon circulation (39), and/or weakened moisture advection due to lower northwestern IO SSTs (12, 40, 41). Although the MWF simulation in iTTRACE...
supports an instantaneous cooling of the surface Arabian Sea and reduced southerly monsoon wind strength during HS1, the reduced specific humidity (Fig. 3D) associated with cooling SSTs (Fig. 3B) over western IO only leads to moderately dry conditions in equatorial and northeast Africa. Our results suggest that the strengthened IO Walker circulation during HS1 and the consequent reduction in convection over the western IO are responsible for widespread droughts in this region (Fig. 3A), such as droughts recorded from Lake Malawi (39), Lake Tanganyika (40), and the complete desiccation of Lake Victoria (42).

Previous studies have also debated the spatially heterogeneous precipitation anomalies over the Maritime Continent, particularly near and north of the equator (17, 22, 27, 43). Our results suggest that stronger ascending motion and convection over the eastern IO due to the anomalously strong Walker circulation were superimposed on a north-south dipole structure caused by southward migration of the ITCZ during HS1 (Fig. 3). These processes could interact constructively to intensify wet conditions in the southern Maritime Continent while creating negative interactions that weaken or eliminate anomalies in the northern tropics, such as Sumatra, leading to a spatially heterogeneous response to HS1 over the Maritime Continent. Weak responses to HS1 were reported in hydrological reconstructions from the coast of Sumatra and Sulawesi (44, 45), whereas dry conditions were inferred from stalagmite δ¹⁸O in northern Borneo (17). On the other hand, multiproxy records from Flores Sea (19), Flores (43), and East Java (46) indicate substantially higher precipitation during HS1.

**Implications for the large-scale water cycle**

Although the HS1 dipole is centered over the IO, it has remote effects on more distal regions, such as the Asian summer monsoon domain. Water isotope–based records throughout Asia are often interpreted to reflect local precipitation amount and the intensity of the Asian summer monsoon (47, 48); however, more recent studies suggested that these records more likely reflect non-local processes, such as changes in the δ¹⁸O of water vapor (δ¹⁸O_vapor) in moisture source regions (23, 49, 50). Previous water tagging experiments using iCESM demonstrate that water vapor over the Asian monsoon region originates mainly from the IO (23), where the IO zonal dipole caused widespread δ¹⁸O_vapor enrichment during HS1. Our simulation results show that the enriched δ¹⁸O_vapor from the western IO is advected into the Asian monsoon region where it contributes to widespread δ¹⁸O_precip anomalies during HS1 (Fig. 4A and fig. S11A), consistent with previous water tagging experiments (23). In addition, reduced precipitation over the Indian subcontinent and southern Asian monsoon region could further intensify the δ¹⁸O_vapor enrichment (23, 49). Both our simulations and proxy data (23) show relatively modest enrichment of δ¹⁸O_vapor in Asian monsoon regions during the YD (23) relative to HS1 (Fig. 4B), indicating that the equatorial IO zonal dynamics are essential to δ¹⁸O_precip in this region.

**DISCUSSION**

Our study suggests that an east-west precipitation dipole developed over the tropical IO during HS1 as a result of a north-south displacement of the ITCZ. The southward ITCZ shift over the eastern IO during HS1 suppresses upwelling of cooler water off Sumatra and Java. The consequent warmer SST in this region strengthens IO Walker circulation via the Bjerknes feedback, triggering an east-west precipitation dipole across the basin. This zonal precipitation dipole triggers hydrological extremes across the tropical IO, including widespread droughts in East Africa and increased precipitation over most of Indonesia. In addition, the enriched δ¹⁸O_precip over western IO caused by the IO zonal dipole has a remote effect on Asian summer monsoon domain and contribute to widespread δ¹⁸O_precip anomalies in this region during HS1.

Although neither exposure of continental shelves nor AMOC shutdown from ice sheet discharge are directly analogous to future climate warming scenarios, the impacts of these forcings on coupled ocean-atmosphere interactions over the IO highlights the sensitivity of zonal asymmetries and their importance to future changes in tropical precipitation patterns. Historical observations and model predictions suggest that increasing atmospheric GHG will cause the IO thermocline to shoal and intensify the ocean-atmosphere feedbacks across the tropical IO, analogous to the glacial background climate state (24, 33–35). The potential for reduced AMOC under global warming suggests the possibility of complex and unpredictable changes in IO zonal circulation and precipitation, as changes in the AMOC could mitigate or exacerbate the impacts of warming.
**MAterials and METHODS**

**Climate model experiments**

We compared a multiproxy synthesis with simulated hydroclimate changes in iTRACE, which is the first transient simulation of the global and water isotope evolutions during the last deglaciation (23). Conducted with iCESM1.3 (51), iTRACE is composed of the Community Atmosphere Model (CAM5.3), the Community Land Model (CLM4), Parallel Ocean Program (POP2), and Los Alamos Sea Ice Model (CICE4). The simulations in iTRACE start from the LGM (20 ka ago) and end at the early Holocene (11 ka ago). Four forcings, including ice sheet and ocean bathymetry, insolation, GHG, and MWF, were applied additively, allowing the estimation of single forcing effect by comparing different simulations. Specifically, the baseline simulation is integrated with changing ice sheets and ocean bathymetry (ICE), before orbital forcings was additively introduced (ICE + ORB), which is followed by GHG (ICE + ORB + GHG). MWF were added to generate a full forcing simulation (ICE + ORB + GHG + MWF).

In iTRACE, the continental ice sheet configuration is based on the ICE-6G model (52) and was modified every 1000 years; GHG concentrations (CO₂, CH₄, and N₂O) were prescribed following ice core reconstructions (53–55); the MWF follows the scheme used in TRACE-21 (56), which is approximately consistent with sea level reconstructions. The global ice history model ICE-6G is based on realistic geological and geodetic observations. The sea level boundary conditions and ocean bathymetry was estimated by applying the global sea level changes according to ICE-6G model to the present-day seafloor topography and was changed at 14 and 12 ka ago. Specifically, the LGM land-sea configuration lasts until 14 ka ago, after which the NW Australia shelf and parts of Sunda shelf were inundated (the Sunda and Sahul shelves coastline corresponds to the ~75-m preindustrial isobath), and the bathymetry of the North Sea, Barents Sea, and Kara Sea were restored to the preindustrial conditions. At 12 ka ago, the main body of the Sunda and Sahul shelves were inundated, and the Bering Strait was partly opened.

The precipitation and water isotope simulations of iCESM have been validated against instrument observations at global scale (51). To further evaluate the performance of iCESM in the IO domain, we compared the iCESM simulations (1850 to 2005) (51, 57) with monthly precipitation data (1979 to 2020) from the Global Precipitation Climatology Project (58) (https://psl.noaa.gov/data/gridded/data.gpcp.html), and monthly δ¹⁸O_{precip} data (1962 to 2016) spanning at least 8 years from the Global Network of Isotopes in Precipitation (GNIP; https://iaea.org/services/networks/gnip). Both observed and simulated precipitation and δ¹⁸O_{precip} anomalies when comparing negative and positive IOD months (IOD index above 0.4 or below −0.4, respectively) show zonal dipole across the tropical IO. Wetter conditions were observed over central and eastern IO and throughout the Maritime Continent, especially the southern Sumatra and east Java, whereas widespread drying dominated the western IO and eastern Africa. Simulated IOD related δ¹⁸O_{precip} anomalies largely resemble observations in East Africa and the Maritime Continent, although the simulated southward extension of δ¹⁸O_{precip} enrichment in the eastern Africa is less than that in the GNIP data.

**Proxy synthesis**

We synthesized well-dated proxy records that have sufficient resolution to observe HS1-BAPrecipitation and SST anomalies from the Maritime Continent and East Africa. All SST proxy records (Mg/Ca of planktic foraminifera or U₁³C index) were normalized and detrended by removing the linear trend in each record to remove the deglacial warming trend before calculating the HS1 SST anomalies. The age models of all proxy records are based on accelerated mass spectrometry (AMS) radiocarbon dates, except for core TY93929/P, GeoB3007-1, and SO93–126 K, whose chronologies are based on oxygen isotope stratigraphy. For consistency, we recalibrated all age models of marine/terrestrial sediment records with radiocarbon chronology using the Marine20 (59) / IntCal20 (60) radiocarbon calibration curve with the BACON age model program (61), except for core AAS9-21, Lake Challa, Lake Rukwa, Lake Victoria, and core MD98-2152. For marine sediments records, Δ AR was determined as the weighted average of ΔR near each site from http://calib.org/marine/. We use the published age models for core AAS9-21 and Lake Challa as their AMS radiocarbon dates are not publicly available. For Lake Rukwa and Lake Victoria, the HS1 precipitation anomalies are inferred from the interpretation in previous literature (62, 63). The δD_{max} record from core MD98-2152 only contains one data point during BA. Core MD98-2152, Lake Rukwa, and Lake Victoria are therefore not included in the Cohen's k analysis.

**Supplementary Materials**

This PDF file includes:

- Tables S1 to S3

**References**

Project administration: J.M.R. and X.D. Writing—original draft: X.D. Writing—review and editing:
Competing interests: The authors declare that they have no competing interests.
Data and materials availability: The proxy data synthesized in this work are available from the PANGAEA database (https://pangaea.de/) and NOAA’s National Climatic Data Center’s Paleoclimatology database (http://ncdc.noaa.gov/paleo/paleo.html). The model simulation results are available at NCAR Climate Data Gateway (https://www.earthsystemgrid.org). All data needed to evaluate the conclusions in the paper are present in the paper and/or the Supplementary Materials.
Submitted 23 June 2022
Accepted 23 November 2022
Published 4 January 2023
10.1126/sciadv.add4909
North Atlantic cooling triggered a zonal mode over the Indian Ocean during Heinrich Stadial 1

Xiaojing Du, James M. Russell, Zhengyu Liu, Bette L. Otto-Bliesner, Delia W. Oppo, Mahyar Mohtadi, Chenyu Zhu, Valier V. Galy, Enno Schefu, Yan Yan, Yair Rosenthal, Nathalie Dubois, Jennifer Arbuszewski, and Yu Gao

DOI: 10.1126/sciadv.add4909

View the article online
https://www.science.org/doi/10.1126/sciadv.add4909
Permissions
https://www.science.org/help/reprints-and-permissions