Emergent Conformal Boundaries from Finite-Entanglement Scaling in Matrix Product States

Rui-Zhen Huang1,*, Long Zhang2, Andreas M. Läuchli3,4, Jutho Haegeman1, Frank Verstraete5,1, and Laurens Vanderstraeten6

1Department of Physics and Astronomy, University of Ghent, 9000 Ghent, Belgium
2Kavli Institute for Theoretical Sciences and CAS Center for Excellence in Topological Quantum Computation, University of Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing 100190, China
3Laboratory for Theoretical and Computational Physics, Paul Scherrer Institute, 5232 Villigen, Switzerland
4Institute of Physics, École Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne (EPFL), 1015 Lausanne, Switzerland
5Department of Applied Mathematics and Theoretical Physics, University of Cambridge, Cambridge, United Kingdom
6Center for Nonlinear Phenomena and Complex Systems, Université Libre de Bruxelles, Brussels, Belgium

(Received 3 July 2023; accepted 23 January 2024; published 23 February 2024)

The use of finite entanglement scaling with matrix product states (MPS) has become a crucial tool for studying one-dimensional critical lattice theories, especially those with emergent conformal symmetry. We argue that finite entanglement introduces a relevant deformation in the critical theory. As a result, the bipartite entanglement Hamiltonian defined from the MPS can be understood as a boundary conformal field theory with a physical and an entanglement boundary. We are able to exploit the symmetry properties of the MPS to engineer the physical conformal boundary condition. The entanglement boundary, on the other hand, is related to the concrete lattice model and remains invariant under this relevant perturbation. Using critical lattice models described by the Ising, Potts, and free compact boson conformal field theories, we illustrate the influence of the symmetry and the relevant deformation on the conformal boundaries in the entanglement spectrum.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevLett.132.086503

Introduction.—The past decades have witnessed the successful application of ideas from quantum information theory in quantum many-body physics, providing new insights beyond conventional many-body techniques [1]. The central insight concerns the entanglement structure in the low-energy states of correlated quantum many-body systems, summarized in the entanglement area law [2] for gapped states or the logarithmic violations thereof in critical systems [3,4]. Here the entanglement Hamiltonian $H_E$, also called the modular Hamiltonian, plays a pivotal role. In a given quantum many-body state, it arises when considering the reduced density matrix of a subsystem, and is defined as

$$\rho = \frac{1}{Z} \exp (-2\pi H_E),$$

in which $Z$ is a normalization factor preserving the unit trace of $\rho$. The low-lying spectrum of $H_E$ or entanglement spectrum often contains fingerprints of the exotic nature of a given quantum state, and can be used as a diagnostic tool in numerical simulations. Famous examples are the degeneracies in the entanglement spectrum of a state with symmetry-protected topological (SPT) order in one dimension [5,6] or the universal form of the entanglement spectrum of a fractional quantum Hall state [7]. The entanglement spectrum also directly determines the entanglement entropy in a given state, which has been identified as one of the key quantities for characterizing topological order [8,9].

For critical phases, the formalism of conformal field theory (CFT) has revealed universal properties of entanglement spectra in one-dimensional systems [3,10,11]. It was observed that the structure of the entanglement spectrum in critical spin chains is the one of a boundary conformal field theory (BCFT) [12], an observation that was later formalized [13]. In a more recent work, the effect of introducing a finite gap by a relevant perturbation was also tackled in general terms [14].

On the other hand, the formalism of tensor networks [15] has proven very fruitful for capturing the correlations in gapped systems, because they naturally model the entanglement structure inherent in the low energy states in these systems. In one dimension, gapped states are described by the class of matrix product states (MPS), to the extent that all gapped phases of one-dimensional matter can be fully classified by MPS using group cohomology [5,6]. In two dimensions, nonchiral topological order can be classified through the class of projected entangled-pair states [16] and tensor network techniques provide a direct way for calculating the entanglement spectra of chiral topological states [17,18].
An injective MPS with finite bond dimension always has a finite correlation length, and can therefore never capture the critical nature of a quantum ground state directly. Instead we have to develop a scaling theory that describes the effect of this finite bond dimension, similar to the theory of finite-size scaling that is used for extracting critical data from, e.g., Monte Carlo simulations or exact diagonalizations on finite clusters. Since a tensor network effectively truncates the amount of entanglement in a quantum state, this gives rise to the theory of finite-entanglement scaling. The fundamental idea has always been that simulating a critical system through MPS induces a finite length scale in the system \([19–21]\), and that this length scale can be used to perform a scaling analysis. This approach has led to a number of interesting results \([22–30]\), making MPS methods very powerful for simulating critical phenomena. Yet, despite these successes, the effect of finite-entanglement scaling on the entanglement spectrum itself has not been addressed.

In this Letter, we use the aforementioned CFT results to shed new light on this fundamental question. We will simulate critical spin chain models with MPS in the thermodynamic limit directly, for which the only approximation is due to the finite bond dimension. We will argue that this entanglement cutoff induces a relevant perturbation of the critical system, and show that this perfectly explains the observed structure in MPS entanglement spectra. In fact, we will show that we can engineer the form of the perturbation by imposing symmetries on the MPS representation.

**General framework.**—Consider a critical spin chain with Hamiltonian \(H^*\), for which the low energy properties are described by an effective CFT. We construct a variational MPS ground state approximation for a Hamiltonian in the vicinity of \(H^*\) directly in the thermodynamic limit \([31,32]\), with a given bond dimension \(D\). We assume we are working in the regime of finite entanglement scaling where the effective length scale of the MPS state \(\xi_D := -1/\log(|\lambda|)\) (\(\lambda\) is the subleading eigenvalue of the transfer matrix composed by the MPS local tensor \([15]\) is much larger than the lattice spacing but smaller than any other length scale (e.g., from not being exactly at criticality). We now propose that this length scale can be modeled as arising from a small relevant perturbation in the CFT. The MPS can thus be viewed as the ground state of a deformed Hamiltonian

\[
H = H^* + \sum_g \xi_D^{-2} O_g + \ldots, \tag{2}
\]

where the \(O_g\) are all relevant operators (operators with a scaling dimension \(\Delta_g < 2\)) and the dots are additional irrelevant terms. Under a renormalization group (RG) flow, the relevant operators become more and more important. It is the most relevant perturbation \(O_g\) governing the scaling properties of MPS.

The effect of this deformation on the entanglement spectrum can be inferred similarly to the discussion in Ref. \([14]\), where the authors considered the imaginary time action of a CFT, perturbed by a primary field. In order to obtain the entanglement Hamiltonian in half-space, one needs to consider a logarithmic conformal mapping, yielding the action

\[
S = S^* + \int_0^\infty dx \int_0^{2\pi} d\tau \, e^{(2-\Delta_g)(x-\log(\xi_D))} O_g + \ldots, \tag{3}
\]

where \(x\) and \(\tau\) denote the Rindler space-time coordinates \([14]\), and \(O_g\) is the relevant perturbation from Eq. (2). One can see that the conformal mapping serves the role of an RG process to the relevant deformation. Under the logarithmic mapping, the uniform \(O_g\) term becomes exponentially large away from the entanglement boundary and the dynamics is frozen except for the region \(0 < x < \log(\xi_D)\). Therefore, it becomes a BCFT with one entanglement boundary \(B_e\) and one physical boundary \(B_p\), the latter being determined by \(O_g\). Significantly, the two boundaries possess distinct physical interpretations and origins. The physical boundary is determined by the relevant deformation in the bulk, while the entanglement one reflects the relation between different degrees of freedom. The entanglement spectrum takes the form of a BCFT spectrum,

\[
\Delta_i \sim \frac{\pi}{\log(\xi_D)} (\Delta_h + n_i), \tag{4}
\]

where \(n_i\) is a non-negative integer, \(h\) is the primary that marks the conformal tower \(V_h\) determined by the fusion rule \(V_e \otimes V_g \sim C_{eg}^{lh} V_h\) following the modular invariance of the partition function \([33–37]\). The distribution of \(\Delta_i\) provides a clear indicator to identify the deformation \(O_g\) to the CFT \([33–37]\).

Among all the allowed relevant deformations in Eq. (2), the entanglement truncation in MPS chooses the most relevant perturbation \(O_g\) that is allowed by the symmetries of the MPS. In generic MPS (with only translation symmetry), the perturbation imposed by the entanglement truncation should be the primary operator with the lowest conformal weight in the corresponding CFT. In continuous phase transitions with symmetry breaking, the most relevant operator is usually a symmetry-breaking term. This explains why finite entanglement tends to result in ordered MPS at the critical point. However, when we impose symmetry constraints in the MPS representation, such a field term is not allowed in Eq. (2), and another deformation will determine the scaling behavior. So we can use the symmetry constraints in the MPS as a selection rule.
to impose different physical conformal boundaries in the entanglement spectrum.

Physical conformal boundaries in MPS.—As a first illustration of our approach, we consider the quantum Ising chain with transverse magnetic field

$$H = -\sum_i \sigma_i^x \sigma_{i+1}^x - h \sum_i \sigma_i^z. \quad (5)$$

It has a global $Z_2$ symmetry and undergoes a continuous phase transition when tuning the field across $h = 1$. This model realizes an Ising CFT at the critical point. We use variational MPS methods \[31,32\] to find ground state approximations for a given bond dimension $D$ directly in the thermodynamic limit. We can easily constrain the MPS approximation to be invariant under the $Z_2$ symmetry by imposing a sparse block structure onto the MPS tensors. We can assume the entanglement boundary to be free\[12\], but elaborate on this in the next section.

In Fig. 1, we show the correlation length and entanglement spectra from nonsymmetric (top) and $Z_2$-symmetric (bottom) MPS simulations. The phase transition is signaled by the singular behaviour of the correlation length $\xi[38]$, where the singular point approaches the true critical point. An interesting observation is that the direction of this shift of the critical point is different in the $Z_2$-symmetric and nonsymmetric cases. This indeed implies that the symmetry of the MPS representation determines the perturbation $O_g$, and that the scaling behavior is therefore very different in both cases.

Let us now investigate the entanglement spectra in some detail. First of all, we note that they all show the $1/\log(\xi)$ scaling behavior, in correspondence with the finite-size scaling of Ref. [12]. In the symmetry-broken case, the most relevant perturbation is a field term, which induces a fixed up $|I\rangle$ or down $|\epsilon\rangle$ physical conformal boundary $B_p$. Together with the free entanglement boundary $B_e$, the entanglement spectrum resembles the operator contents of a BCFT with mixed boundaries, following the fusion rule $\sigma \otimes I/\epsilon = \sigma$. Here the fixed or free boundary means a boundary condition without fluctuation in the temporal or spatial direction, respectively, \[33–35,39,40\]. As a result, the spectrum only contains the spin operator family $V_\sigma$. In the $Z_2$-symmetric MPS, the most relevant perturbation is the energy operator, leading to a free physical boundary $|\sigma\rangle$. As the entanglement boundary remains free, the entanglement spectrum follows from the fusion rule $\sigma \otimes \sigma = I + \epsilon$.

A similar analysis also applies to the critical three-state Potts model \[37,41\], where we can either impose the $Z_3$ symmetry or not. The result is shown in Fig. 2. One can also consider the charge conjugation symmetry in MPS, where a charge-neutral fixed physical boundary is realized\[37\].

Besides the minimal models, which describe symmetry breaking transitions, we also study the entanglement spectrum in the XXZ quantum spin chain,

$$H = \sum_i \sigma_i^x \sigma_{i+1}^x + \sigma_i^y \sigma_{i+1}^y + g \sigma_i^z \sigma_{i+1}^z. \quad (6)$$

In the region $|g| < 1$, the low energy physics can be described by a $c = 1$ free compact boson CFT. When using MPS to
approximate its ground state, the finite entanglement cutoff tends to break either the $U(1)$ symmetry resulting in a Néel ordered state, or the translation invariance resulting in a dimerized state, as dictated by the Lieb-Schultz-Mattis theorem [42]. Again, these two cases can be understood as arising from a perturbation of the critical model, in casu, a staggered field in the $xy$ plane or a dimerization term, respectively. The Néel ordered case is realized in the non-symmetric MPS simulations, similar to the quantum Ising chain calculation. The dimerized state appears if we use $U(1)$ symmetric MPS with a two-site unit cell, with integer $U(1)$ charges on the odd bonds and half-integer charges on the even bonds.

From the Abelian bosonization analysis [37,43], the Néel and dimerized ordered states correspond to the Dirichlet fixed boundary and the Neumann free boundary conditions for the scalar field $\phi$, respectively. To be consistent with the $U(1)$ symmetry in the state, the entanglement boundary realizes a free boundary condition for the scalar field $\phi$. These boundary conditions can be verified in finite spin chains with a boundary field [37]. As a result, the entanglement spectra are very different in the two cases as shown in Fig. 3. In the Néel ordered case, the entanglement Hamiltonian realizes a mixed boundary BCFT. This case is particularly interesting since the spectrum does not depend on the radius of the compact boson or $g$ in Eq. (6) at all. In the dimerized case, the MPS realizes a free boundary BCFT.

Entanglement conformal boundary in topological transitions.—We have shown how to control the physical boundary $B_p$ in the MPS entanglement spectrum, but the entanglement boundary $B_e$ was fixed by the lattice model. In order to realize nontrivial entanglement boundaries, we can look at transitions between an SPT ordered and a symmetry breaking state [44–47].

As an example, we take the cluster Ising spin chain

$$H = \sum_i \sigma_i^x \sigma_{i+1}^x - h (\sigma_i^z \sigma_{i+1}^z + \tau_i^z \tau_{i+1}^z).$$

This model also realizes the Ising CFT at $h = 1$ between a symmetry breaking phase and an SPT phase protected by the on-site $Z_2^x \times Z_2^y$ symmetry. The new term is related to the usual transverse field term in Eq. (5) through a global unitary transformation, which can be viewed as a symmetry twist of the quantum Ising spin chain [45–47]. This twist results in a different entanglement boundary $B_e$ [37,47]. This is confirmed by the numerical data from the MPS simulation as shown in Fig. 4, where we show the entanglement spectrum of the nonsymmetric and $Z_2$-symmetric MPS at the critical point. Although the MPS share similar bulk properties with the conventional Ising chain calculation in Fig. 1, the operator contents realized in the entanglement spectrum are very different. The physical boundary $B_p$ is
the same as in the untwisted Ising model Eq. (5), but now the entanglement boundary $B_+$ is a superposition of up and down fixed boundary states $[45,47]$. It appears that the entanglement boundary inherits the nature of the SPT phase transition, even when the bulk states are ordered. As a result, in the symmetric phase the entanglement spectrum has an exact double degeneracy for each level due to the symmetry twisted $B_+$ $[37]$.

Conclusions and outlook.—In this Letter we have studied the entanglement spectrum in infinite MPS from the BCFT viewpoint. The entanglement Hamiltonian can be described by a BCFT with an entanglement and physical conformal boundary at low energies. We have explicitly related the effect of an entanglement cutoff to a relevant deformation of the CFT describing the critical point. By controlling the symmetry of the MPS, we can alter this deformation and thus the physical boundary. The entanglement boundary, on the other hand, is related to the lattice model and phase transition mechanism. We expect that our Letter will prove very valuable for extracting universal scaling properties of $1 + 1$ dimensional quantum critical points with tensor networks.

It would be interesting to extend our insights to more general algebraic symmetries in MPS $[48,49]$ in order to complete all physical boundary conditions. Another interesting question is to identify and classify emergent entanglement boundaries. Since the entanglement boundary remains invariant under bulk deformations, it can be used as an indicator to classify symmetry-enriched quantum critical points. It would also be interesting to study entanglement spectra in critical models without conformal symmetry $[50,51]$: Near a CFT, the conformal symmetry breaking term can be treated as a perturbation and the perturbative picture used here may be applied to study such theories.

Finally, our result has potential applications for studying the entanglement properties of two-dimensional quantum systems. In particular, it is expected that the boundary MPS of critical PEPS $[52,53]$ show a similar scaling of their entanglement spectra $[54]$. Since the boundary MPS is known to encode the entanglement Hamiltonian of the PEPS $[17]$, we can expect that this scaling carries important information on the topological features of the PEPS itself $[37]$. Also, our results suggest that the finite correlation length scaling in PEPS approximations for two-dimensional quantum critical points $[27–29]$ can also be understood in terms of perturbed 3D CFT; in particular, we can generalize our framework for engineering the different perturbations arising from imposing symmetry constraints in PEPS.

We would like to thank Shenghan Jiang, Luca Tagliacozzo, Lars Bonnes, Huajia Wang, Laurens Lootens, Maarten Van Damme, and Tao Xiang for many helpful discussions. This work was supported by the Research Foundation Flanders, Grants No. G0E1820 and No. G0E1520N. R. Z. H. is supported by a postdoctoral fellowship from the Special Research Fund (BOF) of Ghent University. L. Z. is supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (No. 12174387), and the Innovative Program for Quantum Science and Technology (No. 2021ZD0302600). L. V. is supported by the Research Foundation Flanders (FWO20/PDS/11).

*ruizhen.huang@ugent.be

[29] See Supplemental Material at 

[37] See Supplemental Material at 

[54] As an illustrative example, see the Supplemental Material at [37] for the case of the nearest-neighbor RVB, which includes Refs. [55–57].