What is the potential of silver fir to thrive under warmer and drier climate?

Yann Vitasse^{*1,2}, Alessandra Bottero^{1,2}, Martine Rebetez^{3,4}, Marco Conedera⁵, Sabine Augustin⁶,

Peter Brang¹ & Willy Tinner^{7,8}

¹WSL Swiss Federal Institute for Forest, Snow and Landscape Research, Birmensdorf, Switzerland

²SwissForestLab, Birmensdorf, Switzerland

³University of Neuchatel, Institute of Geography, Neuchatel, Switzerland

⁴WSL Swiss Federal Institute for Forest, Snow and Landscape Research, Neuchatel, Switzerland

⁵WSL Swiss Federal Institute for Forest, Snow and Landscape Research, Cadenazzo, Switzerland

⁶Federal Office for the Environment FOEN, Bern, Switzerland

⁷Institute of Plant Sciences, University of Bern, Switzerland

⁸Oeschger Center for Climate Change Research, University of Bern, Switzerland

*Corresponding author. Tel: +41(0) 44 739 2073, e-mail: yann.vitasse@wsl.ch, ORCID: 0000-0002-7454-505X,

address: Swiss Federal Institute for Forest, Snow and Landscape Research WSL, Forest Dynamics group,

Zürcherstrasse 111, 8903 Birmensdorf, Switzerland

This document is the accepted manuscript version of the following article:
Vitasse, Y., Bottero, A., Rebetez, M., Conedera, M., Augustin, S., Brang, P., & Tinner, W.
(2019). what is the potential of silver fir to thrive under warmer and drier climate?
European Journal of Forest Research, 138(4), 547-560.
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s10342-019-01192-4>

ABSTRACT

Foresters from many countries are seeking for tree species or provenances able to cope with expected climate change. While it becomes clear that some temperate tree species will increasingly suffer from climate warming, the fate of the ecologically and economically important silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) remains uncertain and debated because the ecological requirements of this species, as well as its resilience to drought are still unclear. On the one hand, paleoecological studies reveal that this species was widely distributed under much warmer climate, suggesting a high potential to cope with ongoing and future climate warming. On the other hand, species distribution models (SDMs) generally predict a strong decline of its climatic suitability in the future. This paper aims to clarify the potential of this species to thrive in central and western Europe under predicted climate warming by reviewing the knowledge gained from different fields. Based on insight from different fields, we argue that silver fir has a great potential to thrive under warmer conditions in western and central Europe provided sufficient rainfall, as forecasted by climate models for most regions by 2100. For instance, dendroecological studies demonstrate that silver fir is more resistant and resilient to drought compared to co-occurring species such as Norway spruce, European beech and larch. The most prominent obstacle for increasing the proportion of fir in mixed forests nowadays is ungulate browsing that often prevents its upgrowth.

Key-words: climate warming, dendroecology, drought, European forests, paleoecology, silver fir

1. INTRODUCTION

The effects of climate change-induced rapid warming and prolonged droughts are increasingly impacting forests in Europe (Stott 2016). Economically valuable tree species have been largely favoured and planted beyond their natural (realized) ecological niche, but are now under strong pressure (Conedera et al. 2017). For example, drier and warmer climatic conditions increase the vulnerability of Norway spruce (*Picea abies* (L.) Karst.) to bark beetle outbreaks in central Europe (Jakoby et al. 2015), whereas sweet chestnut (*Castanea sativa* Mill.) in southern Europe is suffering from repeated summer drought (Conedera et al. 2010). Silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) is a key species in Europe for social, economic and ecological aspects. It is an ecologically valuable species in forests that contributes to recreation landscape and biodiversity and provides protection against gravitational hazards and erosion in mountainous regions (Mauri et al. 2016). The wood of silver fir is commercially important and often sold in lots mixed with Norway spruce. However, because of quality issues or aesthetic values (e.g. smell, falling knots, Wolf 2003) silver fir is sometimes less used by modern timber industry than other conifers such as Norway spruce, pines or European larch.

The potential of silver fir under future warmer climate in western and central Europe is unclear due to a lack of shared knowledge regarding its ecological requirements. Yet, forest managers need to know to what degree and on which sites silver fir will be able to maintain viable populations for the next 100 years and in which cases they should consider or foster alternative species. On the one hand, the current distribution of silver fir and the widely used predictions from correlative species distribution models (SDMs) suggest that silver fir will not withstand climatic conditions that will prevail in most regions of western and central Europe by the end of the century (Maiorano et al. 2013, Zimmermann et al. 2014), though most recent SDMs predict range stability of the species under global warming (Dyderski et al. 2018). On the other hand, recent paleoecological studies, as well as process-based and dynamic models accounting for biotic and abiotic disturbances, suggest that this species has a high potential to cope with the

expected climate change. Silver fir may even expand in regions with predicted low summer water deficit as in the forelands of the southern Alps and most areas of central and eastern Europe (Tinner et al. 2013, Bugmann et al. 2015, Henne et al. 2015, Ruosch et al. 2016), but possibly decline in the driest and warmest areas of Europe (Bosela et al. 2017). The purpose of this review is to clarify these contradictory results and to evaluate the potential of silver fir to thrive under expected warmer and drier conditions by evaluating the evidence so far acquired from paleoecological, genetic, dendroecological and ecophysiological studies.

In the first part, we focus on the current distribution and autecology of silver fir. The second part summarizes how the growth and vitality of this species have evolved since the 19th century and which are the environmental drivers of the species' growth variation and mortality. Finally, the last part considers the potential of silver fir to cope with climate change, highlighting silvicultural practices that would help to foster this emblematic species in European forests.

2. DISTRIBUTION AND AUTECOLOGY OF SILVER FIR

2.1 Refugia and survival dynamics during glacial and interglacial cycles of the Pleistocene

The genus *Abies* Mill. is thought to have appeared at high latitudes of the Northern hemisphere at the end of the late Cretaceous around 100 million years ago during a subtropical period, evolving in different species during its southwards migration during the Eocene (Xiang et al. 2007). The genus *Abies* includes about 50 species worldwide with 9 species inhabiting the Mediterranean region in southern Europe, and the other species being concentrated in North America and East Asia. The phylogenetic branch of firs from the Mediterranean region in southern Europe separated from the North America and East Asia branch during the late Eocene (Xiang et al. 2015) or the Miocene (Semerikova and Semerikov 2014).

Among *Abies* species native to Europe, *Abies alba* Mill. is the most widespread and tallest species (Mauri et al. 2016). As for all other tree species in Europe, however, the current distribution of silver fir has been heavily shaped by the glaciations and the subsequent interglacial periods

during the Quaternary, with the Alps constituting a large geographic barrier between the North and the South of Europe (Lang 1994). The Balkan peninsula, the Apennine mountains and the Iberian peninsula were the three main refugia for numerous tree species during the glacial periods of the Quaternary (Bennett et al. 1991, Terhürne-Berson et al. 2004). Palynology and genetic studies support the existence of four glacial refugia for *A. alba* during the last glacial period (reviewed e.g. in Dobrowolska et al. 2017):

1. The Calabrian region in southern Italy (Watts 1985, Konnert and Bergmann 1995, Cheddadi et al. 2014),
2. The northern Apennines and Euganean Hills in northern Italy (Kaltenrieder et al. 2009, Samartin et al. 2016, Piotti et al. 2017, Gubler et al. 2018),
3. North-western Greece in the Southern Balkans massif (Konnert and Bergmann 1995, Terhürne-Berson et al. 2004, Cheddadi et al. 2014),
4. The Pyrenees, north-eastern Spain and south-western France (Konnert and Bergmann 1995, Terhürne-Berson et al. 2004, Alba-Sánchez et al. 2010, Cheddadi et al. 2014).

The postglacial recolonization of the continent by silver fir has been under intense debate over the last decades (Tinner and Lotter 2006), but recent investigations seem to confirm northern Italy and the southern Balkans as the two macrorefugia which have most effectively contributed to its modern distribution and genetic patterns in central Europe (Muller et al. 2007, Cheddadi et al. 2014). However, we cannot exclude the presence of small refugia or even microrefugia that may have contributed to the rapid expansion of the species during the Late Glacial or early Holocene, as it was recently evidenced by the detection of a new refugium in the Euganean Hills (Kaltenrieder et al. 2009; Samartin et al. 2016, Gubler et al. 2018).

Pleistocene glacial-interglacial cycles forced tree populations to survive in very small-sized refugia. Glacial population contractions and interglacial expansions led to repeated contacts among fir species, e.g. the introgressions of *A. alba* with *A. cephalonica* in northern Greece,

leading to the hybrid *Abies x borisii-regis* (Cheddadi et al. 2014). Finally, while the genus *Abies* has undergone significant morphological differentiation, this does not necessarily imply reproductive isolation (Klaehn and Winieski 1962, Linares 2011), suggesting that a geographic, rather than a genetic or physiological separation of species has occurred as the genus evolved. This is probably why all fir species originating from southern Europe are able to hybridize (Greguss et al. 1994). Interestingly, as a rare case for European conifers, but common among the subtropical to tropical conifer species of the southern and northern hemisphere, it has been hypothesized that the species *A. alba* has undergone evolutionary adaptation to strong competition with evergreen and deciduous broadleaved species by arranging its needles horizontally (instead of originally radially) to reach higher light use efficiency (Pfadenhauer and Klötzli 2015). This special subtropical needle arrangement is possibly a legacy of the warm climatic conditions of the Eocene and Miocene ca. 60-5 millions of years ago (Birks and Tinner 2016).

2.2 Human influence on silver fir distribution

As for some other species such as sweet chestnut, European larch (*Larix decidua* Mill.) or walnut (*Juglans regia* L.), human activities have heavily shaped and fragmented the current distribution of silver fir. The increased fire frequency and browsing activity caused by the onset of farming produced a competitive disadvantage to silver fir with respect to other disturbance-indifferent tree species. In fact, silver fir is one of the most palatable woody species in European mixed forest (Fig. 1). Pollen and genetic data suggest that before human-induced disturbances silver fir was abundant in lowland forests south of the Alps, and even at the Mediterranean coast competing with e.g. subtropical *Quercus ilex* between 9000 and 7000 B.P (Hussendörfer 1999, Tinner et al. 1999, Henne et al. 2013, Tinner et al. 2013, Ruosch et al. 2016), reflecting a rapid re-colonization of the area due to more favourable climatic conditions. Subsequently, silver fir dramatically declined between 7000 and 5000 B.P. in the warm lowlands (Tinner et al. 1999).

Some authors even refer to this decline as the ‘Mid-Holocene extinction of silver fir’ (Wick and Möhl 2006). The development of farming (agriculture and grazing) along with population increase, timber exploitation and fire disturbance, have been proposed as major factors to explain the decline of silver fir during the period from 7000 and 2000 BP (Pons and Quezel 1985, Tinner et al. 1999, Conedera et al. 2017), especially from 4000 to 2000 years B.P. (Hussendörfer 1999, Colombaroli et al. 2007). Later, intensive land use changes such as converting forests into agricultural land as well as intensive forest utilization occurred from medieval times until ~AD 1840. In addition, from the 18th century onwards Norway spruce and fast growing pine (*Pinus*) species were largely planted and favoured over silver fir in central Europe to satisfy the rising need for wood supply (Bürgi and Schuler 2003). Similarly, on-site charcoal production disfavoured silver fir in mixed beech-fir stands during the Middle Ages, artificially turning many forests into pure beech coppice stands as for instance on the southern slope of the Alps (Valsecchi et al. 2010). Besides, the largely employed clearcutting silvicultural system in Europe during this period was also detrimental to silver fir (Eichenseer 1997). Although the vitality of silver fir has increased since the 1990s in many stands in central and western Europe (Büntgen et al. 2014), silver fir populations have also locally declined in other areas such as the northern Carpathians, Slovenia and Croatia, mainly due to increasing competition with European beech and ungulate browsing (Vrska et al. 2009, Ficko et al. 2011, Ficko et al. 2016). The current expansion of its distribution towards higher elevations in central and western Europe might be the result of increasing land-use abandonment (Carcaillet and Muller 2005, Chauchard et al. 2010), and of the natural spread of large predators such as the lynx or the wolf in the Alps and the Jura mountains, which have started limiting the browsing pressure by large herbivores (Schnyder et al. 2016).

Fig. 1. Young fir browsed by a chamois (left), and damage caused by ungulates that have injured terminal and lateral shoots (right). Photo credit: U. Wasem.

2.3 Current distribution

As a result of the glacial and interglacial range contractions and expansions as well as the recent impact of human activities described above, the current distribution of silver fir is confined to central and southern Europe from 38 °N latitude at the southern frontier in Calabria to 52°N latitude in eastern Poland (Fig. 2), with a higher concentration in mountain regions. From west to east, silver fir occurs from 1°W longitude in the Pyrenees to 27°E longitude in Romania and Bulgaria (Fig. 2). Silver fir covers a wide range of elevations from below 100 m a.s.l. in Tuscany (Cortini Pedrotti 1967) and 135 m a.s.l. in Poland to elevations slightly below treeline in the Swiss Alps, around 2000 m a.s.l. (Vitasse et al. 2012). Its upper elevation limit is currently increasing mainly due to land use change, and possibly climate warming (Chauchard et al. 2010). Silver fir is often mixed with European beech at lower elevations or latitudes, whereas it is frequently found with Norway spruce, Scots pine (*Pinus sylvestris* L.), and exceptionally with Swiss stone pine (*Pinus cembra* L.) at higher elevations or latitudes. Within this large distribution range, silver fir becomes less abundant in the drier areas at low elevations as in the Hungarian plains (Fig. 2) and is rare in the most continental valleys of the Alps (Vitasse et al. 2018a).

Fig. 2. Current distribution of silver fir (adapted from EUFORGEN 2003)

2.4 Autecology of silver fir based on its current distribution

Generally, silver fir thrives in a large range of temperature conditions (annual temperature from ~ 7 to 13°C or summer temperature from 14° to 19°C), and is mostly found in areas where annual precipitation exceeds 800-1000 mm (Aussenac 2002, Gomez 2012, Tinner et al. 2013). It can withstand low temperatures in winter, around -30°C (Savill et al. 2016), whereas it is considered as sensitive to late frost in spring (Ellenberg 2009), which reduces seedling survival (Aussenac 2002). Fir is sensitive to low air humidity (Guicherd 1994, Rohner and Thürig 2015, Etzold et al. 2018) and prefers oceanic rather than continental climates. A powerful taproot allows the species at its adult stage to cope with dry conditions by accessing deep-water reserves. Juvenile trees are more sensitive to drought, especially air dryness (Aussenac 2002, see next paragraph), and therefore better develop under a canopy that buffers temperature variations and increases air humidity.

Fir can grow in an array of soil types, from acidic to neutral pH, and from poor to rich nutrient availability, but prefers humid and deep soils that do not dry out easily (Mauri et al. 2016, Savill et al. 2016). Where these conditions are lacking (on soils having poor water retention and/or on south facing slopes with high solar radiation) silver fir becomes sensitive to drought (Cailleret and Davi 2011, Gomez 2012). The species is also sensitive to atmospheric pollution, in particular to sulphur dioxide, which has caused its decline in many parts of Europe during the period 1950-1990 (Elling et al. 2009a, Elling et al. 2012) when unprecedented concentrations of SO₂ in the air were reached (Hoesly et al. 2018).

Silver fir is very shade tolerant (Ellenberg 2009) and unlike Scots pine, and to a lesser extent Norway spruce, it is favoured by a dense canopy during its recruitment phase as shade limits the competition of other species (de Andrés et al. 2014, Mauri et al. 2016, Savill et al. 2016). However, fir seedlings are very susceptible to browsing by large herbivores, which can jeopardize or heavily reduce the regeneration success of the species, in particular under deep shade where its capacity for compensatory growth is limited (Ammer 1996, Motta 1996, Kupferschmid et al. 2013). Regarding insects, it is occasionally attacked, in particular during extended drought, by the fir engraver beetle (*Pityokteines curvidens*), which leads to yellowing, reddening and finally the death of older or weakened trees (Maksymov 1950). Another insect affecting young trees is the silver fir adelges (*Dreyfusia nordmannianae*), an aphid that can cause important damage to young trees (Ravn et al. 2013). As for other tree species, damage by insect pests is expected to increase in the future as these insects develop faster under warmer conditions. Silver fir is also sensitive to the white mistletoe, which has been shown to significantly reduce its growth (Noetzli et al. 2003, Durand-Gillmann et al. 2014). Finally, the species does not display any adaptive traits to fire disturbance (thick bark, resprouting capacity, serotinous cones) and is thus particularly disadvantaged in case of intense and repeated fires (Tinner et al. 2000, Caudullo and Tinner 2016).

3. SENSITIVITY OF THE SPECIES TO MEAN AND EXTREME CLIMATIC EVENTS

3.1 *Insight from dendroecological studies*

Dendroecological studies allow to improve our understanding of the relationship between tree growth and climatic factors, as well as resistance (capacity to avoid growth reduction during extreme events or disturbances) and resilience (ability to regain pre-disturbance growth levels) of species to extreme climatic events, such as the exceptional drought that occurred in summer 2003. Numerous dendroecological studies have been conducted on silver fir attempting to identify the main environmental drivers of growth variation. Silver fir growth rates have overall substantially increased in many European regions during the period 1880–1950, likely promoted by warmer climate with similar levels of summer precipitation, as well as fertilization by nitrogen deposition and human-induced CO₂ increase (Büntgen et al. 2014).

During the 1970s and the early 1980s, a marked growth decline and dieback was synchronously detected in many forests for several tree species in Europe, especially silver fir. Silver fir growth decline was observed in the central Pyrenees (Chéret et al. 1987), in the Vosges mountains (Becker et al. 1989), in Bavaria, (Elling et al. 2009b), in the Black Forest in southwest Germany (Elling et al. 2009a, Vitali et al. 2017), in Croatia (Čavlović et al. 2015), in the Swiss Jura mountains (Bloesch 1983) and in eastern Europe such as in Romania and Slovakia (Gazol et al. 2015, Bosela et al. 2016, Bosela et al. 2018), also visible in the examples of the average annual fir growth shown for three stations in south-eastern Germany, Poland and Slovenia in Fig. 3 (panels d, e and f, respectively). This growth decline and mortality were attributed to increased air pollution during the 1970s, in particular due to the strong increase of sulphur dioxide emissions (SO₂), which reached a maximum air concentration in the early 1980s in Europe (Hoesly et al. 2018), causing substantial damage to conifer needles (Schütt and Cowling 1985, Kandler and Innes 1995, Elling et al. 2009b, Čavlović et al. 2015). Sulfur dioxide in the air forms, together with NH₃, ammonium sulfate, which then deposits on soil and trees, causing damage to

the needles. Furthermore, sulfur deposition lead to soil acidification that reduces soil pH, and, below a pH of < 4.5 , mobilizes Al, which is toxic for tree fine roots (Van Breemen et al. 1982, Gruber 1994). The lower vitality of silver fir during the 1970s due to air pollution may have affected the analyses on its growth responses to other stressors occurring during the same period, (e.g., the severe drought 1976, Uhl et al. 2013), hence overestimating the effects of such stressors.

Finally, since the 1980s contrasting growth responses have been observed for silver fir across Europe (Gazol et al. 2015, Bosela et al. 2018). On the one hand, silver fir has grown exceptionally fast since the mid-1980s in central and northern Europe, but also in central and northern Italy, and this trend has been even enhanced since 2000 (Büntgen et al. 2014, Bosela et al. 2018, also visible in the few examples displayed in Fig. 3). This growth improvement was presumably the consequence of the decline of atmospheric SO_2 , air warming with constant precipitation and/or the further increase of nitrogen deposition (acting as fertilizer) observed in most parts of western and central Europe (Elling et al. 2009b, Büntgen et al. 2014). However, for the latter factor, the results of the National Forest Inventory in Switzerland show that high nitrogen depositions can lead to reduced fir growth (Rohner et al. 2018), which was also observed in intensive monitoring plots (Etzold et al. 2018). Nevertheless, radial growth has been reported to decline since the 1980s towards its southwestern distribution limit such as in the Spanish Pyrenees (Camarero et al. 2011, Linares and Camarero 2012, Camarero et al. 2015, Gazol et al. 2015, see example shown in Fig. 3b) or in southeastern France (Cailleret et al. 2014). In Spain, the recent growth decline of silver fir and dieback observed locally is the likely consequence of the cumulative effect of very dry years that have followed the exceptionally warm and dry summer of 2003 (Macias et al. 2006, Peguero-Pina et al. 2007, Camarero et al. 2011, Linares and Camarero 2012, Büntgen et al. 2014, Gazol et al. 2015, Davi and Cailleret 2017, Latreille et al. 2017). However, the different growth patterns observed in the Spanish Pyrenees could also be related to the different lineage of this population and its possible lower genetic diversity caused by genetic drift.

Fig. 3. Examples of average annual fir growth (expressed as basal area increments, BAI, $\text{cm}^2 \text{yr}^{-1}$) in the Pyrenees (a, data from Camarero et al. 2011), Switzerland (b, data from ITRDB, Büntgen SWIT309), , central Italy (c, data from Lombardi et al. 2008), Germany (d, data from ITRDB, Wilson GERM060), Poland (e, data from ITRDB, Szymura POLA021), Slovenia (f, data from ITRDB, Levanič SLOV002) and Bosnia and Herzegovina (g, data from Ducić et al. 2014). Elevation (in m a.s.l.) and sample size are reported in each panel. Note that different sampling designs used in dendroclimatological studies can bias population growth rate estimates (Nehrbass - Ahles et al. 2014) but these examples are used here to show the general growth pattern observed in Europe since 1900.

Not surprisingly, the climatic effect over the growth of silver fir varies within its distribution area. Typically, at lower elevations in the central part of its range, growth is positively related to

precipitation, such as in the Black Forest in southwestern Germany (van der Maaten-Theunissen et al. 2012, Vitali et al. 2018), in the Vosges and Jura Mountains in eastern France and northwestern Switzerland (Rolland et al. 1999), in southeastern France (Latreille et al. 2017) or in central Italy (Mazza et al. 2014), whereas at mid and high elevations, it responds positively to increased winter, spring and early summer temperature, but is not significantly affected by variation in precipitation (van der Maaten-Theunissen et al. 2012, Vitali et al. 2018). Although summer droughts reduce silver fir growth, the impact is less pronounced than for other co-existing tree species. For example, the often co-occurring Norway spruce displays a higher sensitivity to summer droughts, regardless of elevation, in southwestern Germany (van der Maaten-Theunissen et al. 2012, Vitali et al. 2017) or in the French Alps (Desplanque et al. 1998). Similarly, long-term monitoring of tree growth and tree-ring analyses conducted in Switzerland, in southern Germany and southern France show that silver fir is more resistant to drought than Norway spruce, larch and European beech (Zingg and Bürgi 2008, Cailleret and Davi 2011, Rothe et al. 2011, Zang et al. 2014), and as resistant as Douglas fir (*Pseudotsuga menziesii*; Vitali et al. 2017).

Three elements could explain the relatively high resistance of silver fir to drought. First, silver fir's primary growth cessation occurs early in the season, usually in early July, while the strongest droughts generally occur in July and August (Aussenac 2002). Second, fir often grows on deep soils and its pivotal root system allows it to access water in deeper layers, in contrast to Norway spruce, and to a lesser extent European beech (Stokes et al. 2007). Third, this species controls its transpiration efficiently *via* the rapid closure of its stomata in response to VPD increase (Guicherd 1994, Aussenac 2002, Nourtier et al. 2014), even in deep and wetter soil (Nourtier et al. 2014). This rapid stomatal closure under dry air, starting when VPD exceeds ca. 0.3 kPa (Guicherd 1994), is referred to as 'avoidance strategy' of drought for minimizing the risk of xylem embolism (Jones and Sutherland 1991). Thus, silver fir can potentially endure severe short occasional droughts, but needs in the long term a relatively high air humidity for photosynthesis,

growth and nonstructural carbohydrate reserves to compete with the other species. It is probably for this reason that this species is particularly found on north-exposed slopes and deep soils (Henne et al. 2013) with high atmospheric humidity, especially at the southern margin of its distribution.

3.2 Growth responses to climate: insights from warming experiments, transplant experiments and provenance trials

In contrast to other dominant tree species in Europe, such as Norway spruce or European beech, only a few studies have dealt with the sensitivity of silver fir to drought and warmer temperatures. Experimental measurements of the photosynthetic capacity of silver fir seedlings exposed to various temperatures (from 10 to 40°C) in climate chambers during 24 h showed a rather high tolerance to heat stress with irreversible injuries to the photosystem occurring only above 47°C for seedlings acclimatized to 10°C (Robakowski et al. 2002), with a photosynthetic optimum around 20°C (only 15°C for Norway spruce, Gomez 2012). By contrast, numerous provenance trials have been conducted during the second half of the 20th century to select provenances with high performance in terms of growth and stem quality, but also to detect provenances with high drought tolerance. Overall, most provenance trials highlighted little genetic differentiation among provenances for adaptive traits such as frost resistance (Larsen 1986), growth (Larsen 1986, Commarmot 1997, Bourdenet 1998, Vitasse et al. 2009, Kerr et al. 2015, Frank et al. 2017b), or drought resilience (Sindelar and Beran 2008, George et al. 2015), despite the very contrasting local climate conditions the investigated populations originate from (Herzog and Rotach 1990). Generally, provenances from the highest elevations are more resistant to frost and develop more slowly than those from lower altitudes (Larsen 1986, Vitasse et al. 2009). However, genetic differentiation in silver fir is generally lower than in other species such as Norway spruce or European beech (Vitasse et al. 2009, Frank et al. 2017b), which reduces the risk that silver fir will suffer from maladaptation under warmer climate (Frank et al. 2017a).

The recolonization trajectories of silver fir populations during the last glacial-interglacial cycles seem to have produced two genetically distinct lineages in central Europe with different sensitivities to climatic variations (Bosela et al. 2016). For instance, a study based on tree-ring width series and genetic samples from 78 populations along the Carpathian Arc has shown that the Balkan lineage has higher genetic diversity and is more sensitive to drought at the beginning of the growing season than the western lineage originating from northern Italy, which is more sensitive to summer drought (Bosela et al. 2016). Finally, successful silver fir plantations located at the warm edge of its distribution exist, demonstrating the high plasticity of this species. For example, the ~200-year-old fir plantation in Varramista, Tuscany, located only 30 m above sea level, as well as other lowland stands in Tuscany, show successful natural fir regeneration and relatively low to no dieback (Cortini Pedrotti 1967, Birks and Tinner 2016, Tinner et al. 2016) (Fig. 4) where moisture availability is sufficiently high (e.g. deep soils at slope bottom, northern slopes).

Fig. 4. Plain lowland *A. alba* forest at Varramista, Tuscany, close to the Mediterranean Sea. Species co-occurring in the forest with *A. alba* are *Quercus ilex*, *Fraxinus ornus*, *Ilex aquifolium*, *Hedera helix*, *Vitis sylvestris*, *Castanea sativa*, *Quercus petraea*, *Ficus carica*, *Acer campestre*, *Corylus avellana*, *Ruscus aculeatus*. Mean temperatures at the site are ca. 24 °C in July, 7 °C for January, and 15.5°C for the whole year. Annual mean precipitation in the area reaches ca. 850 mm with a pronounced summer drought in July and August (ca. 25 mm mean precipitation each). However, the trees have access to ground water on this site. Source of climatic data: Cortini Pedrotti (1967); vegetation survey and picture: W. Tinner (20 May 2014)

4. POTENTIAL ABILITY OF SILVER FIR TO FACE CLIMATE WARMING IN EUROPE

4.1 Divergences between model predictions and paleoecological studies

Most species distribution models (SDMs) based on correlative approaches between current species occurrence and related climatic conditions predict dramatic losses of climatic suitable areas for silver fir in Europe by the end of the century, irrespective of the climate scenario considered (Badeau et al. 2007, Zimmermann et al. 2016). By contrast, paleoecology and genetic studies suggest that before strong human influence (i.e. about 5000 years ago), silver fir occurred abundantly under significantly warmer climates than today, likely exceeding the current temperature at the warm edge of its distribution by 5-9 °C (reviewed in Tinner et al. 2013). These studies therefore suggest that silver fir has high potential to face climate warming, which is also supported by recent dynamic vegetation model results (Ruosch et al. 2016), provided browsing pressure and fire disturbance remain (naturally) low (Keller et al. 2002, Henne et al. 2011, Henne et al. 2013, Ruosch et al. 2016). SDMs are based on correlations between today's species occurrences and climatic parameters. This makes them unable to capture rare and past occurrences, as in the case of fir at the warm margins of its climatic niche. Consequently, SDMs may fail to attribute climate suitability to extant silver fir forests in southern Europe (Maiorano et al. 2013; Tinner et al. 2013). Even when paleoecological data were included at the European scale to refine the models, SDM results still suggested dramatic losses of future climate suitability of silver fir in about 40% of its current range by 2100 based on scenario B1 (Maiorano et al. 2013). This failure might be caused by the rarity of pollen records and modern occurrences from the warmest areas of the Mediterranean, resulting in a modest overall spatial resolution and coverage that impedes SDM to deliver reliable local assessments. In contrast, SDMs that used highly resolved spatial data were able to accurately simulate the extant range of *Abies alba* including the southernmost populations, and do not predict a dramatic decrease of suitable climate of this species under moderate climate change scenarios (Tinner et al. 2013, Dyderski et

al. 2018). For instance, by using occurrence data from the Global Biodiversity Information Facility and EUFORGEN in addition to occurrence data provided from national forest inventories (typically used in SDMs), Dyderski et al. (2018) showed also the lowest proportion of threatened area (12.8%) for silver fir in the future under a moderate climatic scenario compared to the other 11 European forest tree species studied. Similarly, recent dendroecological studies suggest that growth of silver fir will likely be enhanced in future decades in the Black Forest in southwestern Germany, even under the most extreme climatic scenario (RCP8.5) because the species could benefit from warmer winters and springs compensating for drier summers (Vitali et al. 2018).

4.2 The crucial role of water availability

Ecophysiological and dendroecological studies suggest that silver fir is rather tolerant to warm temperatures (often qualified as a thermophilous or warm-temperate species), and can cope to a certain extent with severe summer drought, being similarly resistant as Douglas fir, but more than Norway spruce or European beech (Zang et al. 2014, Vitali et al. 2017). The analysis of climate data from its current distribution and bioclimatic models allow to estimate that silver fir requires rainfall greater than 600-700 mm per year and greater than 90-120 mm during the three warmest summer months (Tinner et al. 2013). These climatic conditions are currently present in most parts of its fragmented distribution and beyond (Panagos et al. 2015). We surmise that silver fir can thrive under such low limits of precipitation provided that the soil can store sufficient water, air humidity is sufficient, or that deep water can be accessed by the taproots (Aussenac 2002, Henne et al. 2013, Tinner et al. 2013). Thus, with sufficient precipitation or air humidity during the growing season, and limited fire and browsing disturbance, silver fir may thrive in most parts of central and western Europe. This may apply even in southern Europe in lowlands near the Mediterranean coast, as revealed by the existence of mixed cryptic *Abies alba* – *Quercus ilex* stands that regenerate spontaneously in central and southern Italy on suitable soils (Cortini Pedrotti 1967, Tinner et al. 2013, Birks and Tinner 2016). However, these conditions may no

longer be present in the lowlands of the Mediterranean region in the future (Ruosch et al. 2016), where summer precipitation is predicted to significantly decrease by 2100, such as in Spain, southern France and Italy (IPCC 2013).

4.3 Promoting silver fir in European forests

Silvicultural practices and wildlife management will strongly influence the future occurrence of silver fir in European forests. As a pronounced late-successional species, silver fir is particularly sensitive to silvicultural practices. In stands with fir presence, practices which cause abrupt environmental changes such as clear-cutting negatively affect silver fir (Eichenseer 1997) as it was the case in the past in regions such as the Carpathians (Vrska et al. 2009). In contrast, silver fir regeneration profits from long regeneration periods and slow removal of shelter trees. Uneven-aged silvicultural systems providing low light conditions such as the single-tree or the group selection system allow the regeneration of silver fir to outcompete other species, which is not the case under elevated light intensity (Grassi et al. 2004). Moreover, even with the most appropriate silvicultural system, fir recruitment often fails if browsing pressure is not sufficiently limited by wildlife management (Ficko et al. 2016), or appropriate protective measures such as individual protections or fences.

Promoting silver fir in future European forests means introducing it in stands where it is currently absent. This can be best achieved by underplanting silver fir seedlings in adult stands of other species, at any time in uneven-aged stands, or one to two decades before the final cut in regular (mono-layered) stands, to allow the seedlings of silver fir to benefit from a competitive advantage over the regeneration of other species. In most cases, such underplanting will require protective measures against browsing (Kupferschmid et al. 2013).

4.4 Genetic pool and other fir species

Beyond silvicultural interventions, sustainable management requires some thoughts to promote the genetic diversity of the species (guarantor of a high potential for adaptation) and to consider the use of other Mediterranean fir species. As previously mentioned, silver fir seems to have a

less diversified genetic variation between populations than other forest species such as Norway spruce. This low genetic variability among populations may somewhat paradoxically be beneficial as it allows for a more generalist behaviour in the face of climatic hazards, reducing the risk of 'maladaptation' under future climate (Frank et al. 2017a). Such an interpretation is supported by new paleogenetic results from warm areas where the species went locally extinct as a consequence of excessive anthropogenic disturbance (Schmid et al. 2017). Nevertheless, although the genetic diversity among populations seems low, genetic diversity within populations is high, even in marginal populations (Brousseau et al. 2016), which is an asset for the species to adapt to climate warming. This high genetic diversity can also be promoted using silvicultural practices that foster pollination over long distances, for example by reducing the stem density of reproducing trees (see synthesis of the different methods in Lefèvre et al. 2014).

Besides, silver fir resistance to weather extremes has probably been underestimated within extant populations. Some marginal populations are currently growing in sites with a much warmer and drier climate than the climatic limits commonly found in the literature. For example, populations growing in central and southern Italy, at only 30 m of elevation, are accompanied by an array of typically Mediterranean species (Tinner et al. 2016). It is, however, not advisable to rely only on such marginal populations as seed sources since they are isolated and therefore possibly prone to genetic erosion (Belletti et al. 2017). However, more investigations should be conducted on these marginal populations to assess whether they have genetically evolved to better tolerate summer drought and could therefore potentially be used as seed source.

Other Mediterranean fir species could also be considered as alternatives to Norway spruce or European beech in a warmer-than-today Europe, such as e.g. *A. cephalonica* or *A. borisii-regis*, which share physical properties of wood and similar ecological requirements to those of silver fir, but with a higher resistance to prolonged droughts. Provenance tests using these species were conducted in southern France at various altitudes and showed a high potential for both species to grow in drier climates and to cope with long periods of summer drought (Fady 1993).

This strong resilience to drought can be explained by their early spring phenology and short growing season, with both species ending their annual growth only within 30 to 45 days after the emergence of new needles, well before the occurrence of summer droughts (Fady 1993). However, the precocious phenology may put these two species at greater risk of frost, a risk that remains high in the Alps despite climate warming (Vitasse et al. 2018b) and to which silver fir seems more adapted. Further investigations are needed to assess the potential of other fir species to thrive in the central and southern part of silver fir distribution.

5. CONCLUSIONS

The debate concerning the future suitability of silver fir to thrive under warmer and drier climates is still open and based on contradictory positions that derive from studies using markedly different approaches. However, this synthesis unambiguously shows that it is possible to reconcile these positions. Despite recent progresses in SDM simulations that now predict range stability or moderate change of silver fir under strongly warming climates (Dyderski et al. 2018), the heavy impact of humans in restricting the current distribution of the species suggests caution when interpreting the outcomes of SDMs. Therefore, it is not surprising that paleoecological and process-based modelling studies challenge SDM-inferred predictions that claim strong declines of the species in central Europe. Dendroecological studies support the paleoecological evidence, demonstrating that silver fir is more resistant and resilient to drought than Norway spruce, European beech, or larch, and similar to Douglas fir in this respect, especially since sulfur dioxide concentrations have decreased. Given the growing scientific evidence for the species' ability to cope with climate change, it seems reasonable to preserve and foster this emblematic species in European forests, particularly in mountainous areas where it plays a vital role for prevention against erosion and avalanches.

A concern is that silver fir may suffer more in the future from insect attacks such as the fir engraver beetle (*Pityokteines curvidens*), which is favored by rising temperatures and summer

droughts. Rising temperature is expected to accelerate the development cycle of this beetle, while increasing summer drought may weaken fir trees, but this is also true for other host/pest pairs such as Norway spruce and the spruce bark beetle (*Ips typographus*). A cautious forest management, aimed at gradually increasing the presence of silver fir in mixed forests, is therefore justified. Such a procedure would mimic the natural conditions before the advent of agriculture, when *Abies alba* was growing in species rich and climatically resilient mixed forests in mediterranean and temperate Europe.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This review was funded by the research program ‘Forest and Climate Change’ of the Federal Office for the Environment and the Swiss Federal Research Institute WSL, and was also supported by the SwissForestLab. This paper was initially published in French in Schweizerische Zeitschrift für Forstwesen (Vitasse et al. 2018a) and was adapted with the agreement of this journal to upscale the results to an international readership across Europe.

AUTHORS’ CONTRIBUTIONS

P.B. and S.A. conceived the idea. Y.V. led the writing with input from all the other authors. A.B. collected the data shown in figure 3 and drew the figure 3.

DATA ACCESSIBILITY

The sources of the data used in figure 3 are cited in the caption legend of the figure.

References

- Alba-Sánchez, F, López-Sáez, JA, Pando, BBd, Linares, JC, Nieto-Lugilde, D and López-Merino, L (2010) Past and present potential distribution of the Iberian *Abies* species: a phytogeographic approach using fossil pollen data and species distribution models. *Divers Distrib* 16(2):214-228.
- Ammer, C (1996) Impact of ungulates on structure and dynamics of natural regeneration of mixed mountain forests in the Bavarian Alps. *For Ecol Manage* 88(1-2):43-53.
- Aussenac, G (2002) Ecology and ecophysiology of circum-Mediterranean firs in the context of climate change. *Ann For Sci* 59(8):823-832.
- Badeau, V, Dupouey, J-L, Cluzeau, C and Drappier, J (2007) Aires potentielles de répartition des essences forestières d'ici 2100. *RDV techniques ONF (hors-série n°3)*:62-66.
- Becker, MG, Landmann, G and Levy, G (1989) Silver fir decline in the Vosges mountains (France): role of climate and silviculture. *Water, Air, and Soil Pollution* 48:77-86.
- Bennett, K, Tzedakis, P and Willis, K (1991) Quaternary refugia of north European trees. *J Biogeogr* 103:115.
- Birks, HJB and Tinner, W (2016). Past forests of Europe. In: San-Miguel-Ayanz, J., de Rigo, D., Caudullo, G., Houston Durrant, T. and Mauri, A. (eds.), *European Atlas of Forest Tree Species* Publication Office of the European Union, pp. 36-39.
- Bloesch, U. 1983. Beitrag zum Problem des Weisstannensterbens: Untersuchungen über die langfristige Entwicklung der absterbenden Weisstannen auf repräsentativen Standorten inner- und ausserhalb des Optimalbereiches der Weisstanne auf Grund der Zwangsnutzungsstatistiken im Kanton Neuenburg, sowie Abklärung der Kausalzusammenhänge, insbesondere mit klimatischen Hypothesen. Professur für Waldbau. – ETH Zürich p. 74.
- Bosela, M, Popa, I, Gömöry, D, Longauer, R, Tobin, B, Kyncl, J, Kyncl, T, Nechita, C, Petráš, R, Sidor, CG, Šebeň, V and Büntgen, U (2016) Effects of post-glacial phylogeny and genetic diversity on the growth variability and climate sensitivity of European silver fir. *J Ecol* 104(3):716-724.
- Bosela, M, Lukac, M, Castagneri, D, Sedmák, R, Biber, P, Carrer, M, Konôpka, B, Nola, P, Nagel, TA, Popa, I, Roibu, CC, Svoboda, M, Trotsiuk, V and Büntgen, U (2017) Contrasting effects of environmental change on the radial growth of co-occurring beech and fir trees across Europe. *Sci Total Environ*.
- Bosela, M, Lukac, M, Castagneri, D, Sedmák, R, Biber, P, Carrer, M, Konôpka, B, Nola, P, Nagel, TA, Popa, I, Roibu, CC, Svoboda, M, Trotsiuk, V and Büntgen, U (2018) Contrasting effects of environmental change on the radial growth of co-occurring beech and fir trees across Europe. *Sci Total Environ* 615(Supplement C):1460-1469.
- Bourdenet, P (1998) Essais d'adaptation et peuplements de référence de sapins méditerranéens mis en place par l'Office National des Forêts. *Forêt méditerranéenne* 19(2):183-188.
- Brousseau, L, Postolache, D, Lascoux, M, Drouzas, AD, Källman, T, Leonarduzzi, C, Liepelt, S, Piotti, A, Popescu, F and Roschanski, AM (2016) Local adaptation in European firs assessed

563 through extensive sampling across altitudinal gradients in southern Europe. PLoS One
564 11(7):e0158216.

565 Bugmann, H, Brang, P, Elkin, C, Henne, PD, Jakoby, O, Lévesque, M, Lischke, H, Psomas, A,
566 Rigling, A and Wermelinger, B (2015). Climate change impacts on tree species, forest properties,
567 and ecosystem services. In: OCCR, FOEN, MeteoSwiss, C2SM, Agroscope and ProClim (eds.),
568 CH2014-Impacts, Toward Quantitative Scenarios of Climate Change Impacts in Switzerland.

569 Büntgen, U, Tegel, W, Kaplan, JO, Schaub, M, Hagedorn, F, Bürgi, M, Brázdil, R, Helle, G,
570 Carrer, M, Heussner, K-U, Hofmann, J, Kontic, R, Kyncl, T, Kyncl, J, Camarero, JJ, Tinner, W,
571 Esper, J and Liebhold, A (2014) Placing unprecedented recent fir growth in a European-wide and
572 Holocene-long context. *Front Ecol Environ* 12(2):100-106.

573 Bürgi, M and Schuler, A (2003) Driving forces of forest management—an analysis of
574 regeneration practices in the forests of the Swiss Central Plateau during the 19th and 20th
575 century. *For Ecol Manage* 176(1):173-183.

576 Cailleret, M and Davi, H (2011) Effects of climate on diameter growth of co-occurring *Fagus*
577 *sylvatica* and *Abies alba* along an altitudinal gradient. *Trees-Struct Funct* 25(2):265-276.

578 Cailleret, M, Nourtier, M, Amm, A, Durand-Gillmann, M and Davi, H (2014) Drought-induced
579 decline and mortality of silver fir differ among three sites in Southern France. *Ann For Sci*
580 71(6):643-657.

581 Camarero, JJ, Bigler, C, Linares, JC and Gil-Pelegrín, E (2011) Synergistic effects of past
582 historical logging and drought on the decline of Pyrenean silver fir forests. *For Ecol Manage*
583 262(5):759-769.

584 Camarero, JJ, Gazol, A, Sangüesa-Barreda, G, Oliva, J and Vicente-Serrano, SM (2015) To die
585 or not to die: early warnings of tree dieback in response to a severe drought. *J Ecol* 103(1):44-
586 57.

587 Carcaillet, C and Muller, SD (2005) Holocene tree-limit and distribution of *Abies alba* in the
588 inner French Alps: anthropogenic or climatic changes? *Boreas* 34(4):468-476.

589 Caudullo, G and Tinner, W (2016). *Abies*–Circum-Mediterranean firs in Europe: distribution,
590 habitat, usage and threats. In: J. San-Miguel-Ayanz, D., De Rigo, G., Caudullo, T., Houston
591 Durrant, T. and Mauri, A. (eds.), *European Atlas of Forest Tree Species*. Publication Office of
592 the European Union, pp. 50-51.

593 Čavlović, J, Bončina, A, Božić, M, Goršić, E, Simončič, T and Teslak, K (2015) Depression and
594 growth recovery of silver fir in uneven-aged Dinaric forests in Croatia from 1901 to 2001.
595 *Forestry* cpv026.

596 Chauchard, S, Beilhe, F, Denis, N and Carcaillet, C (2010) An increase in the upper tree-limit of
597 silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) in the Alps since the mid-20th century: A land-use change
598 phenomenon. *For Ecol Manage* 259(8):1406-1415.

599 Cheddadi, R, Birks, HJB, Tarroso, P, Liepelt, S, Gömöry, D, Dullinger, S, Meier, ES, Hülber, K,
600 Maiorano, L and Laborde, H (2014) Revisiting tree-migration rates: *Abies alba* (Mill.), a case
601 study. *Veg Hist Archaeobot* 23(2):113-122.

602 Chéret, V, Dagnac, J and Fromard, F (1987) Le dépérissement du sapin dans les Pyrénées
603 luchonnaises. *Revue forestière française* 39(1):12-24.

Colombaroli, D, Marchetto, A and Tinner, W (2007) Long-term interactions between Mediterranean climate, vegetation and fire regime at Lago di Massaciuccoli (Tuscany, Italy). *J Ecol* 95(4):755-770.

Commarmot, B (1997) Anbauversuch mit kalabrischen Tannen in verschiedenen Höhenlagen—erste Ergebnisse. *Schweiz Z Forstwiss* 148:353-365.

Conedera, M, Barthold, F, Torriani, D and Pezzatti, G (2010) Drought sensitivity of *Castanea sativa*: case study of summer 2003 in the Southern Alps. *Acta horticulturae* 866:297-302.

Conedera, M, Colombaroli, D, Tinner, W, Krebs, P and Whitlock, C (2017) Insights about past forest dynamics as a tool for present and future forest management in Switzerland. *For Ecol Manage* 388:100-112.

Cortini Pedrotti, C (1967) L'abetina di Varramista (Pisa). *Flora fanerogamica e briologica e caratteristiche geobotaniche*. *Webbia* 22(1):39-65.

Davi, H and Cailleret, M (2017) Assessing drought-driven mortality trees with physiological process-based models. *Agric For Meteorol* 232:279-290.

de Andrés, EG, Camarero, JJ, Martínez, I and Coll, L (2014) Uncoupled spatiotemporal patterns of seed dispersal and regeneration in Pyrenean silver fir populations. *For Ecol Manage* 319:18-28.

Desplanque, C, Rolland, C and Michalet, R (1998) Dendroclimatologie comparée du sapin et de l'épicéa dans les zones internes des vallées alpines nord-occidentales (France et Italie). *Ecologie* 29(1-2):351-355.

Dobrowolska, D, Bončina, A and Klumpp, R (2017) Ecology and silviculture of silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.): a review. *J For Res* 22(6):326-335.

Ducić, V, Ivanović, R, Mihajlović, J, Gnjato, R, Trbić, G and Ćurčić, NB (2014) Dendroindication of drought in Rogatica region (Eastern Bosnia). *Archives of Biological Sciences* 25-25.

Durand-Gillmann, M, Cailleret, M, Boivin, T, Nageleisen, L-M and Davi, H (2014) Individual vulnerability factors of silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) to parasitism by two contrasting biotic agents: mistletoe (*Viscum album* L. ssp. *abietis*) and bark beetles (*Coleoptera: Curculionidae: Scolytinae*) during a decline process. *Ann For Sci* 71(6):659-673.

Dyderski, MK, Paż, S, Frelich, LE and Jagodziński, AM (2018) How much does climate change threaten European forest tree species distributions? *Glob Change Biol* 24(3):1150-1163.

Eichenseer, F (1997) Entwicklung der Tannenanteile in Ostbayern im 19. und 20. Jahrhundert. *Forst und Holz* 52(17):498-501.

Ellenberg, HH (2009). *Vegetation Ecology of Central Europe*. University Press.

Elling, W, Dittmar, C, Pfaffelmoser, K and Rotzer, T (2009a) Dendroecological assessment of the complex causes of decline and recovery of the growth of silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) in Southern Germany. *For Ecol Manage* 257(4):1175-1187.

641 Elling, W, Dittmar, C, Pfaffelmoser, K and Rötzer, T (2009b) Dendroecological assessment of
642 the complex causes of decline and recovery of the growth of silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) in
643 Southern Germany. *For Ecol Manage* 257(4):1175-1187.

644 Elling, W, Heber, U, Polle, A and Beese, F (2012). *Schädigung von Waldökosystemen:*
645 *Auswirkungen anthropogener Umweltveränderungen und Schutzmaßnahmen.* Spektrum
646 Akademischer Verlag.

647 Etzold, S, Zweifel, R, Haeni, M, Burri, S, Braun, S, Walther, L, Dawes, MA, Buchmann, N,
648 Haeler, E, Köchli, R, Schaub, M and Eugster, W (2018). *TreeNet. Daten und Analysen der ersten*
649 *fünf Messjahre.*

650 EUFORGEN. 2003. Distribution map of silver fir (*Abies alba*). First published in 2003, updated
651 on 25 November 2011.

652 Fady, B (1993) Caractéristiques écologiques et sylvicoles des sapins de Grèce dans leur aire
653 naturelle et en plantation dans le sud de la France. Perspectives pour le reboisement en région
654 méditerranéenne. *Revue forestière française* 45(2):119-133.

655 Ficko, A, Poljanec, A and Boncina, A (2011) Do changes in spatial distribution, structure and
656 abundance of silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) indicate its decline? *For Ecol Manage* 261(4):844-854.

657 Ficko, A, Roessiger, J and Bončina, A (2016) Can the use of continuous cover forestry alone
658 maintain silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) in central European mountain forests? *Forestry* 89(4):412-
659 421.

660 Frank, A, Howe, GT, Sperisen, C, Brang, P, Clair, JBS, Schmatz, DR and Heiri, C (2017a) Risk
661 of genetic maladaptation due to climate change in three major European tree species. *Glob Chang*
662 *Biol* 23(12):5358-5371.

663 Frank, A, Sperisen, C, Howe, GT, Brang, P, Walthert, L, St Clair, JB and Heiri, C (2017b)
664 Distinct genecological patterns in seedlings of Norway spruce and silver fir from a mountainous
665 landscape. *Ecology* 98(1):211-227.

666 Gazol, A, Camarero, JJ, Gutiérrez, E, Popa, I, Andreu-Hayles, L, Motta, R, Nola, P, Ribas, M,
667 Sangüesa-Barreda, G and Urbinati, C (2015) Distinct effects of climate warming on populations
668 of silver fir (*Abies alba*) across Europe. *J Biogeogr* 42(6):1150-1162.

669 George, J-P, Schueler, S, Karanitsch-Ackerl, S, Mayer, K, Klumpp, RT and Grabner, M (2015)
670 Inter- and intra-specific variation in drought sensitivity in *Abies spec.* and its relation to wood
671 density and growth traits. *Agric For Meteorol* 214–215:430-443.

672 Gomez, N (2012) Quel avenir pour le sapin et l'épicéa ? Synthèse bibliographique sur
673 l'autécologie et la vulnérabilité comparée du sapin et de l'épicéa dans le cadre des changements
674 climatiques. *Rendez-vous techniques (hors série no. 6):*3-8.

675 Grassi, G, Minotta, G, Tonon, G and Bagnaresi, U (2004) Dynamics of Norway spruce and silver
676 fir natural regeneration in a mixed stand under uneven-aged management. *Canadian Journal of*
677 *Forest Research* 34(1):141-149.

678 Greguss, L, Longauer, R and Krajnáková, J. 1994. Progress in the breeding program of specific
679 hybridization of first (a review). - In: Eder, W. (ed.) *Ergebnisse des 7. IUFRO-*
680 *Tannensymposiums der WP S1.01-08 "Ökologie und Waldbau der Tanne",* pp. 144-153.

681 Gruber, F (1994). Morphology of coniferous trees: possible effects of soil acidification on the
682 morphology of Norway spruce and silver fir. In: Godbold, D. and Hättermann, A. (eds.), Effects
683 of acid rain on forest processes. Wiley-Liss, pp. 265-324.

684 Gubler, M, Henne, PD, Schwörer, C, Boltshauser-Kaltenrieder, P, Lotter, AF, Brönnimann, S
685 and Tinner, W (2018) Microclimatic gradients provide evidence for a glacial refugium for
686 temperate trees in a sheltered hilly landscape of Northern Italy. J Biogeogr.

687 Guicherd, P (1994) Water relations of European silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) in 2 natural stands
688 in the French Alps subject to contrasting climatic conditions. Ann Sci For 51(6):599-611.

689 Henne, PD, Elkin, CM, Reineking, B, Bugmann, H and Tinner, W (2011) Did soil development
690 limit spruce (*Picea abies*) expansion in the Central Alps during the Holocene? Testing a
691 palaeobotanical hypothesis with a dynamic landscape model. J Biogeogr 38(5):933-949.

692 Henne, PD, Elkin, C, Colombaroli, D, Samartin, S, Bugmann, H, Heiri, O and Tinner, W (2013)
693 Impacts of changing climate and land use on vegetation dynamics in a Mediterranean ecosystem:
694 insights from paleoecology and dynamic modeling. Landsc Ecol 28(5):819-833.

695 Henne, PD, Elkin, C, Franke, J, Colombaroli, D, Calò, C, La Mantia, T, Pasta, S, Conedera, M,
696 Dermody, O and Tinner, W (2015) Reviving extinct Mediterranean forest communities may
697 improve ecosystem potential in a warmer future. Front Ecol Environ 13(7):356-362.

698 Herzog, M and Rotach, P (1990) Trockenresistenz und Immissionshärte der Weisstanne (*Abies*
699 *alba* Mill.): Fröhstuntersuchungen mit vier Provenienzen. Schweizerische Zeitschrift für
700 Forstwesen 141(12):989-1010.

701 Hoesly, RM, Smith, SJ, Feng, L, Klimont, Z, Janssens-Maenhout, G, Pitkanen, T, Seibert, JJ,
702 Vu, L, Andres, RJ and Bolt, RM (2018) Historical (1750–2014) anthropogenic emissions of
703 reactive gases and aerosols from the Community Emissions Data System (CEDS). Geoscientific
704 Model Development 11(1):369.

705 Hussendörfer, E (1999) Genetic variation of silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) populations in
706 Switzerland. Forest Genetics 6(2):101-113.

707 IPCC (2013). Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working
708 Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change.
709 Cambridge University Press.

710 Jakoby, O, Wermelinger, B, Stadelmann, G and Lischke, H (2015) Borkenkäfer im Klimawandel
711 Modellierung des künftigen Befallsrisikos durch den Buchdrucker (*Ips typographus*).

712 Jones, H and Sutherland, R (1991) Stomatal control of xylem embolism. Plant, Cell &
713 Environment 14(6):607-612.

714 Kaltenrieder, P, Belis, CA, Hofstetter, S, Ammann, B, Ravazzi, C and Tinner, W (2009)
715 Environmental and climatic conditions at a potential Glacial refugial site of tree species near the
716 Southern Alpine glaciers. New insights from multiproxy sedimentary studies at Lago della Costa
717 (Euganean Hills, Northeastern Italy). Quat Sci Rev 28(25-26):2647-2662.

718 Kandler, O and Innes, JL (1995) Air pollution and forest decline in Central Europe. Environ
719 Pollut 90(2):171-180.

720 Keller, F, Lischke, H, Mathis, T, Möhl, A, Wick, L, Ammann, B and Kienast, F (2002) Effects
721 of climate, fire, and humans on forest dynamics: forest simulations compared to the palaeological
722 record. *Ecol Model* 152(2):109-127.

723 Kerr, G, Stokes, V, Peace, A and Jinks, R (2015) Effects of provenance on the survival, growth
724 and stem form of European silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) in Britain. *Eur J For Res* 134(2):349-363.

725 Klaehn, F and Winieski, J (1962) Interspecific hybridization in the genus *Abies*. *Silvae Genet*
726 11(5/6):130-142.

727 Konnert, M and Bergmann, F (1995) The geographical distribution of genetic variation of silver
728 fir (*Abies alba*, Pinaceae) in relation to its migration history. *Plant Syst Evol* 196(1):19-30.

729 Kupferschmid, AD, Zimmermann, S and Bugmann, H (2013) Browsing regime and growth
730 response of naturally regenerated *Abies alba* saplings along light gradients. *For Ecol Manage*
731 310393-404.

732 Lang, G (1994) Quartäre Vegetationsgeschichte Europas: Methoden und Ergebnisse. Fischer,
733 Jena.

734 Larsen, JB (1986) Die geographische Variation der Weißtanne (*Abies alba* Mill.)
735 Wachstumsentwicklung und Frostresistenz. *Forstwiss Centbl* 105(1):396-406.

736 Latreille, A, Davi, H, Huard, F and Pichot, C (2017) Variability of the climate-radial growth
737 relationship among *Abies alba* trees and populations along altitudinal gradients. *For Ecol Manage*
738 396150-159.

739 Lefèvre, F, Boivin, T, Bontemps, A, Courbet, F, Davi, H, Durand-Gillmann, M, Fady, B,
740 Gauzere, J, Gidoïn, C, Karam, M-J, Lalagüe, H, Oddou-Muratorio, S and Pichot, C (2014)
741 Considering evolutionary processes in adaptive forestry. *Ann For Sci* 71(7):723-739.

742 Linares, JC (2011) Biogeography and evolution of *Abies* (Pinaceae) in the Mediterranean basin:
743 the roles of long-term climatic change and glacial refugia. *J Biogeogr* 38(4):619-630.

744 Linares, JC and Camarero, JJ (2012) Growth patterns and sensitivity to climate predict silver fir
745 decline in the Spanish Pyrenees. *Eur J For Res* 131(4):1001-1012.

746 Lombardi, F, Cherubini, P, Lasserre, B, Tognetti, R and Marchetti, M (2008) Tree rings used to
747 assess time since death of deadwood of different decay classes in beech and silver fir forests in
748 the central Apennines (Molise, Italy). *Canadian Journal of Forest Research* 38821-833.

749 Macias, M, Andreu, L, Bosch, O, Camarero, JJ and Gutiérrez, E (2006) Increasing aridity is
750 enhancing silver fir *Abies alba* mill.) water stress in its south-western distribution limit. *Clim*
751 *Change* 79(3-4):289-313.

752 Maiorano, L, Cheddadi, R, Zimmermann, NE, Pellissier, L, Petitpierre, B, Pottier, J, Laborde, H,
753 Hurdu, BI, Pearman, PB, Psomas, A, Singarayer, JS, Broennimann, O, Vittoz, P, Dubuis, A,
754 Edwards, ME, Binney, HA and Guisan, A (2013) Building the niche through time: Using 13,000
755 years of data to predict the effects of climate change on three tree species in Europe. *Glob Ecol*
756 *Biogeogr* 22(3):302-317.

757 Maksymov, JK. 1950. Untersuchungen über den krummzähnigen Weißtannenborkenkäfer *Ips*
758 *curvidens* Germ. während seiner Massenvermehrung 1947-49 in der Schweiz. – ETH Zurich.

759 Mauri, A, de Rigo, D and Caudullo, G (2016). *Abies alba* in Europe: distribution, habitat, usage
760 and threats. In: European Atlas of Forest Tree Species. Publication Office of the European Union,
761 pp. 48-49.

762 Mazza, G, Gallucci, V, Manetti, MC and Urbinati, C (2014) Climate–growth relationships of
763 silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) in marginal populations of Central Italy. *Dendrochronologia*
764 32(3):181-190.

765 Motta, R (1996) Impact of wild ungulates on forest regeneration and tree composition of
766 mountain forests in the western Italian Alps. *For Ecol Manage* 8893-98.

767 Muller, SD, Nakagawa, T, De Beaulieu, J-L, Court-Picon, M, Carcaillet, C, Miramont, C, Roiron,
768 P, Boutterin, C, Ali, AA and Bruneton, H (2007) Post-glacial migration of silver fir (*Abies alba*
769 Mill.) in the south-western Alps. *J Biogeogr* 34(5):876-899.

770 Nehrbass-Ahles, C, Babst, F, Klesse, S, Nötzli, M, Bouriaud, O, Neukom, R, Dobbertin, M and
771 Frank, D (2014) The influence of sampling design on tree-ring-based quantification of forest
772 growth. *Glob Change Biol* 20(9):2867-2885.

773 Noetzli, KP, Müller, B and Sieber, TN (2003) Impact of population dynamics of white mistletoe
774 (*Viscum album* ssp. *abietis*) on European silver fir (*Abies alba*). *Ann For Sci* 60(8):773-779.

775 Nourtier, M, Chanzy, A, Cailleret, M, Yingge, X, Huc, R and Davi, H (2014) Transpiration of
776 silver Fir (*Abies alba* mill.) during and after drought in relation to soil properties in a
777 Mediterranean mountain area. *Ann For Sci* 71(6):683-695.

778 Panagos, P, Ballabio, C, Borrelli, P, Meusburger, K, Klik, A, Rousseva, S, Tadić, MP,
779 Michaelides, S, Hrabalíková, M and Olsen, P (2015) Rainfall erosivity in Europe. *Sci Total*
780 *Environ* 511801-814.

781 Peguero-Pina, JJ, Camarero, JJ, Abadía, A, Martín, E, González-Cascón, R, Morales, F and Gil-
782 Pelegrín, E (2007) Physiological performance of silver-fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) populations under
783 contrasting climates near the south-western distribution limit of the species. *Flora-Morphology,*
784 *Distribution, Functional Ecology of Plants* 202(3):226-236.

785 Pfadenhauer, JS and Klötzli, FA (2015). *Vegetation der Erde: Grundlagen, Ökologie,*
786 *Verbreitung.* Springer-Verlag.

787 Piotti, A, Leonarduzzi, C, Postolache, D, Bagnoli, F, Spanu, I, Brousseau, L, Urbinati, C,
788 Leonardi, S and Vendramin, GG (2017) Unexpected scenarios from Mediterranean refugial
789 areas: disentangling complex demographic dynamics along the Apennine distribution of silver
790 fir. *J Biogeogr* n/a-n/a.

791 Pons, A and Quezel, P (1985) history of the flora and vegetation and past and present human
792 disturbance in the Mediterranean region. *Geobotany*.

793 Ravn, HP, Havill, N, Akbulut, S, Footitt, R, Serin, M, Erdem, M, Mutun, S and Kenis, M (2013)
794 *Dreyfusia nordmanniana* in Northern and Central Europe: potential for biological control and
795 comments on its taxonomy. *J Appl Entomol* 137(6):401-417.

796 Robakowski, P, Montpied, P and Dreyer, E (2002) Temperature response of photosynthesis of
797 silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) seedlings. *Ann For Sci* 59(2):163-170.

798 Rohner, B and Thürig, E (2015) Entwicklung klimasensitiver Wachstumsfunktionen für das
799 Szenariomodell «Massimo». Schweizerische Zeitschrift für Forstwesen 166(6):389-398.

800 Rohner, B, Waldner, P, Lischke, H, Ferretti, M and Thürig, E (2018) Predicting individual-tree
801 growth of central European tree species as a function of site, stand, management, nutrient, and
802 climate effects. Eur J For Res 137(1):29-44.

803 Rolland, C, Michalet, R, Desplanque, C, Petetin, A and Aime, S (1999) Ecological requirements
804 of *Abies alba* in the French Alps derived from dendro-ecological analysis. J Veg Sci 10(3):297-
805 306.

806 Rothe, A, Dittmar, C and Zang, C (2011) Tanne–vom Sorgenkind zum Hoffnungsträger. LWF
807 Wissen 6659-63.

808 Ruosch, M, Spahni, R, Joos, F, Henne, PD, Knaap, WO and Tinner, W (2016) Past and future
809 evolution of *Abies alba* forests in Europe–comparison of a dynamic vegetation model with palaeo
810 data and observations. Glob Change Biol 22(2):727-740.

811 Samartin, S, Heiri, O, Kaltenrieder, P, Köhl, N and Tinner, W (2016) Reconstruction of full
812 glacial environments and summer temperatures from Lago della Costa, a refugial site in Northern
813 Italy. Quat Sci Rev 143107-119.

814 Savill, P, Wilson, SM, Mason, B and Jinks, R (2016) Silver Firs (*Abies* spp) of Europe and the
815 Near East: species, silviculture, and utilisation potential. Quarterly Journal of Forestry 11016-27.

816 Schmid, S, Genevest, R, Gobet, E, Suchan, T, Sperisen, C, Tinner, W and Alvarez, N (2017)
817 HyRAD-X, a versatile method combining exome capture and RAD sequencing to extract
818 genomic information from ancient DNA. Methods in Ecology and Evolution 8(10):1374-1388.

819 Schnyder, J, Ehrbar, R, Reimoser, F and Robin, K (2016) Huftierbestände und
820 Verbissintensitäten nach der Luchswiederansiedlung im Kanton St. Gallen. Schweizerische
821 Zeitschrift für Forstwesen 167(1):13-20.

822 Schütt, P and Cowling, EB (1985) Waldsterben, a general decline of forests in central Europe:
823 symptoms, development and possible causes. PLANT DIS 69(7):548-558.

824 Semerikova, SA and Semerikov, VL (2014) Molecular phylogenetic analysis of the genus *Abies*
825 (*Pinaceae*) based on the nucleotide sequence of chloroplast DNA. Russ J Genet 50(1):7-19.

826 Sindelar, J and Beran, F (2008) Comparison of some exotic species of *Abies* genus with chosen
827 silver fir provenances on the plots of town Pisek. Communicationes Instituti Forestalis
828 Bohemicae 2499-114.

829 Stokes, A, Ghani, MA, Salin, F, Danjon, F, Jeannin, H, Berthier, S, Kokutse, AD and Frochot, H
830 (2007). Root morphology and strain distribution during tree failure on mountain slopes. In:
831 Stokes, A., Spanos, I., Norris, J. E. and Cammeraat, E. (eds.), Eco-and Ground Bio-Engineering:
832 The Use of Vegetation to Improve Slope Stability: Proceedings of the First International
833 Conference on Eco-Engineering 13–17 September 2004. Springer Netherlands, pp. 165-173.

834 Stott, P (2016) How climate change affects extreme weather events. Science 352(6293):1517-
835 1518.

- 836 Terhürne-Berson, R, Litt, T and Cheddadi, R (2004) The spread of *Abies* throughout Europe
837 since the last glacial period: combined macrofossil and pollen data. *Veg Hist Archaeobot*
838 13(4):257-268.
- 839 Tinner, W, Hubschmid, PH, Wehrli, M, Amman, B and Conedera, M (1999) Long-term forest
840 fire ecology and dynamics in southern Switzerland. *J Ecol* 87(2):273-289.
- 841 Tinner, W, Conedera, M, Gobet, E, Hubschmid, P, Wehrli, M and Ammann, B (2000) A
842 palaeoecological attempt to classify fire sensitivity of trees in the southern Alps. *The Holocene*
843 10(5):565-574.
- 844 Tinner, W and Lotter, AF (2006) Holocene expansions of *Fagus silvatica* and *Abies alba* in
845 Central Europe: where are we after eight decades of debate? *Quat Sci Rev* 25(5):526-549.
- 846 Tinner, W, Colombaroli, D, Heiri, O, Henne, PD, Steinacher, M, Untenecker, J, Vescovi, E,
847 Allen, JR, Carraro, G and Conedera, M (2013) The past ecology of *Abies alba* provides new
848 perspectives on future responses of silver fir forests to global warming. *Ecol Monogr* 83(4):419-
849 439.
- 850 Tinner, W, Conedera, M, Bugmann, H, Colombaroli, D, Gobet, E, Vescovi, E, Heiri, O, Joos, F,
851 Luterbacher, J and La Mantia, T (2016) Europäische Wälder unter wärmeren Klimabedingungen:
852 neue Erkenntnisse aus Paläoökologie und dynamischer Vegetationsmodellierung. *AFZ-Der*
853 *Wald* 71(18):45-49.
- 854 Uhl, E, Ammer, C, Spellmann, H, Schölch, M and Pretzsch, H (2013) Zuwachstrend und
855 Stressresilienz von Tanne und Fichte im Vergleich. *Allg Forstund Jagdzeitung* 184(11-12):278-
856 292.
- 857 Valsecchi, V, Carraro, G, Conedera, M and Tinner, W (2010) Late-Holocene vegetation and
858 land-use dynamics in the Southern Alps (Switzerland) as a basis for nature protection and forest
859 management. *The Holocene* 20(4):483-495.
- 860 Van Breemen, N, Burrough, P, Velthorst, Ev, Van Dobben, H, de Wit, T, Ridder, Td and
861 Reijnders, H (1982) Soil acidification from atmospheric ammonium sulphate in forest canopy
862 throughfall. *Nature* 299(5883):548-550.
- 863 van der Maaten-Theunissen, M, Kahle, H-P and van der Maaten, E (2012) Drought sensitivity of
864 Norway spruce is higher than that of silver fir along an altitudinal gradient in southwestern
865 Germany. *Ann For Sci* 70(2):185-193.
- 866 Vitali, V, Buntgen, U and Bauhus, J (2017) Silver fir and Douglas fir are more tolerant to extreme
867 droughts than Norway spruce in south-western Germany. *Glob Change Biol* 23(12):5108-5119.
- 868 Vitali, V, Buntgen, U and Bauhus, J (2018) Seasonality matters—The effects of past and
869 projected seasonal climate change on the growth of native and exotic conifer species in Central
870 Europe. *Dendrochronologia* 48:1-9.
- 871 Vitasse, Y, Delzon, S, Bresson, CC, Michalet, R and Kremer, A (2009) Altitudinal differentiation
872 in growth and phenology among populations of temperate-zone tree species growing in a
873 common garden. *Can J For Res-Rev Can Rech For* 39(7):1259-1269.
- 874 Vitasse, Y, Hoch, G, Randin, CF, Lenz, A, Kollas, C and Körner, C (2012) Tree recruitment of
875 European tree species at their current upper elevational limits in the Swiss Alps. *J Biogeogr*
876 39(8):1439-1449.

877 Vitasse, Y, Rebetez, M, Augustin, S and Brang, P (2018a) Quel avenir pour le sapin blanc en
878 Suisse sous les effets des changements climatiques? Schweizerische Zeitschrift für Forstwesen
879 169(3):131-142.

880 Vitasse, Y, Schneider, L, Rixen, C, Christen, D and Rebetez, M (2018b) Increase in the risk of
881 exposure of forest and fruit trees to spring frosts at higher elevations in Switzerland over the last
882 four decades. Agric For Meteorol 248:60-69.

883 Vrska, T, Adam, D, Hort, L, Kolar, T and Janik, D (2009) European beech (*Fagus sylvatica* L.)
884 and silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) rotation in the Carpathians: a developmental cycle or a linear
885 trend induced by man? For Ecol Manage 258:347-356.

886 Watts, WA (1985) A long pollen record from Laghi di Monticchio, southern Italy: a preliminary
887 account. J Geol Soc 142(3):491-499.

888 Wick, L and Möhl, A (2006) The mid-Holocene extinction of silver fir (*Abies alba*) in the
889 Southern Alps: a consequence of forest fires? Palaeobotanical records and forest simulations.
890 Veg Hist Archaeobot 15(4):435.

891 Xiang, Q-P, Wei, R, Shao, Y-Z, Yang, Z-Y, Wang, X-Q and Zhang, X-C (2015) Phylogenetic
892 relationships, possible ancient hybridization, and biogeographic history of *Abies* (Pinaceae)
893 based on data from nuclear, plastid, and mitochondrial genomes. Mol Phylogenet Evol 82, Part
894 A1-14.

895 Xiang, X, Cao, M and Zhou, Z (2007) Fossil history and modern distribution of the genus *Abies*
896 (Pinaceae). Frontiers of Forestry in China 2(4):355-365.

897 Zang, C, Hartl-Meier, C, Dittmar, C, Rothe, A and Menzel, A (2014) Patterns of drought
898 tolerance in major European temperate forest trees: climatic drivers and levels of variability.
899 Glob Change Biol 20(12):3767-3779.

900 Zimmermann, NE, Normand, S and Psomas, A (2014) PorTree Final Report.

901 Zimmermann, NE, Schmatz, D, Gallien, L, Körner, C, Huber, B, Frehner, M, Küchler, M and
902 Psomas, A (2016). Répartition des espèces forestières et adéquation des stations. In: Pluess, A.
903 R., Augustin, S. and Brang, P. (eds.), Forêts et changements climatiques – Éléments pour des
904 stratégies d'adaptation. Office fédéral de l'environnement OFEV, Berne; Institut fédéral de
905 recherche WSL, Birmensdorf. Haupt, pp. 205-228.

906 Zingg, A and Bürgi, A (2008) Trockenperioden seit 1900 und Waldwachstum: eine Analyse
907 langfristiger Datenreihen| Drought periods since 1900 and growth of forest stands: an analysis of
908 long-term data series. Schweizerische Zeitschrift für Forstwesen 159(10| 2008):352-361.
909